HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION FEBRUARY 27, 2012 APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS C14H-2007-0011 Kocurek Building 511 W. 41st Street

PROPOSAL

Demolish the rear addition to the auxiliary building; re-side the exposed back wall with board-and-batten siding; replace damaged roof shingles; install new front porch posts.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The rear addition fell down last month; it was structurally unsound and in very poor condition. The applicant proposes to install new board-and-batten siding over the nowexposed rear wall of the building, re-creating the historic board-and-batten siding under the existing back wall. The applicant further proposes to replace damaged roof shingles with composition shingles matching the existing shingles, and to replace the rotten (and believed to be not historic) front porch posts with new wood porch posts.

Staff measured the existing front porch posts, and determined that they are 7.5 inches square, including a fascia board. The applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated posts with new wood posts with the same dimensions.

Please see the accompanying photographs of the existing, exposed back wall. There is evidence of board-and-batten siding under the now-exposed interior wall finish, although the battens have been removed and the boards are very deteriorated. It is also very probable that the entire house originally had board-and-batten siding, but the battens have all been removed and the house is now completely sheathed in asbestos shingles.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Commission's Standards for Review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness include:

- Do not destroy the distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Avoid the removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features.
- Recognize all buildings, structures, and sites as products of their own time. Do not construct alterations which have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance.
- Changes which have taken place over time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Recognize and respect the changes, which may have acquired significance in their own right.
- Repair, rather than replace deteriorated architectural features wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Base the repair or replacement of missing architectural features on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

B.10 - 2

- Construct new additions or alterations to structures in such a manner that if such addition or alteration were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure will be unimpaired.
- Conceal the installation of protective or code-required mechanical systems whenever possible so as not to intrude upon or detract from the aesthetic and historical qualities of the property, except where concealment would result in the alteration or destruction of historically-significant materials or spaces.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee expressed concerns that the applicant was proposing to use a $4 \ge 4$ posts for the front porch and had not yet fleshed out a plan on how to address the now-exposed back walls. Staff met with the owners, and recommended new board-and-batten siding over the existing wall in the back of the house (with the hope that the applicants will someday consider removing the asbestos siding and restoring or recreating the board-and-batten siding on all sides of the house), and the 7.5 inch square porch posts, which the applicants have agreed to.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

With the new plan that will restore more accurately the historic appearance of the house, staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the rear addition (now gone), the application of board-and-batten siding to the rear wall, and the replacement of the front porch posts with new wood posts of the same dimension.



Rear wall of the auxiliary siding – the old board and batten is visible at the sill.

B.10 - 3



Detail view of the boards (missing battens) at the sill; south side of the building. The interior wall of the now-demolished rear addition covers the original boards.



The west side of the building has asbestos siding; a horizontally-laid wood wall is underneath.