



**PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**REGULAR MEETING
Monday, August 5, 2013**

The Public Safety Commission convened in a regular meeting on Monday, August 5, 2013 at City Hall, 301 West 2nd Street in Austin, Texas.

Chair Michael Lauderdale, called the Board Meeting to order at 4:03 PM.

Board Members in Attendance:

Kim Rossmo
Michael Lauderdale
Reynaldo Moreno
Ramey Ko
Sam Holt
Mike Levy
Kent Anschutz

1. Approval of Minutes

- a. The minutes for the regular meeting on 7/01/2013 were approved on Commissioner Chair Lauderdale's motion, Commissioner Kim Rossmo's second and a 7-0 unanimous vote.

2. Citizen Communications

- Mary Arnett originally signed up to discuss both the APD budget and the agenda item License Plate Scanners. Chair Lauderdale stated that they would not have time to discuss the License Plate Scanners at this meeting and would add it to a future meeting. Mrs. Arnett is very concerned about the uncommitted time. She feels that the citizens in the outer reams of Austin are not supported by their District Representatives (DRs). She feels the DRs are being pulled away all the time and that is a symptom of the uncommitted time being as slow as it is. Mrs. Arnett wants the Chief's monthly reports to spell out as clearly as the can, what APD's current officers per 1000 in reality. She believes there should be citizen input on what they see on the Chief's monthly report or reporting in general. Public Information requests are very large in number and Mrs. Arnett hopes that the City considers approving a Crime Analyst along with the 47 officers for APD.
- Johnson Anderson addressed the Commission regarding APD's Field Photo Policy. He believes APD is violating their own policy regarding taking field photographs while on duty. He addressed the concerns he has with APD taking photos of protestors and is concerned

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

with how those photos are used. He would like the Commission to investigate the practice of peaceful protestors and journalists exercising their First Amendment activity specifically asking why these photos are taken, stored, and for what purpose? He also asks the Commission to investigate if APD is violating its own policy with this practice. Vice Chair Rossmo asked if there were any writings given to Mr. Anderson's through his public information request. Mr. Anderson commented that he was told there were no writings that went along with the pictures released to him. Commissioner Holt commented on Mr. Anderson's view that APD should only be allowed to take pictures of protestors if they have a legitimate reason; he asked Mr. Anderson if he considered protests a legitimate reason to take pictures. Mr. Anderson did not agree that protests were a legitimate reason for APD to take pictures of protestors and especially not photo journalists.

- Ceci Gracias is speaking in support of adding a Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer or Questioning (LGBTQ) Liaison to APD's Liaison Office. The LGBTQ community in Austin is over 100,000 and many are concerned with their safety. The Liaison will be a point of contact for the community and help open communication. Vice Chair Rossmo asked that APD provide a report of the number of crimes against that community to the commission to help them understand the extent of the issue. Commissioner Ko was under the impression that APD was considering adding a LGBTQ Labor Head Liaison and asked Chief Gay if he could provide some insight on that process. Chief Gay was not aware that APD was considering adding a LGBTQ Liaison, but he will get more information for next time. Commissioner Ko knows that the African American, Latino, and Asian liaisons for APD has really strengthened the relationship between the communities and law enforcement.

3. Discussion and Possible Action Items

e. *FY13 – 14 Budget Resolution(s) for EMS, AFD, and APD – Public Safety Commission*

Chief Evans (AFD) commented that he did not have any updates or changes at this time. Chair Lauderdale commented to APD Assistant Chief Troy Gay about a needs request that came from APD Assistant Chief Manley and Police Chief Acevedo calling for 92 additional officers. The City budget will authorize 47 officers which will maintain the metric of 2 officers per 1000 citizens. They were told recently by Chief Manley that uncommitted time is about 15 percent and some are saying that uncommitted time of 25 percent is mandatory if you are going to be able to do community policing. Chief Gay was not prepared to talk about this particular subject, but did provide an overview of the request for additional officers. APD did make a request for 47 officers to maintain their 2.0 per 1000. Chief Manley discussed previously the PERF recommendations where APD came up with the 92 officers to increase their committed time. Due to budgetary constraints they will maintain the 47 officers. There are no new unmet needs requests for APD at this time. The Public Safety Commission recommends the City Council approve 92 new officers for the FY14 budget year and encourages the Council to consider an LGBTQ Community Liaison position to further build trust and communication between the citizens of the LGBTQ community and the police. The recommendation for the 92 officers was proposed by Chair Lauderdale, seconded by Vice Chair Rossmo and approved on a 6-1 vote with Commissioner Anschutz voting against. Vice Chair Rossmo asked if APD could provide calls for service information for the last five years; we currently only see the demand and how

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

that is changing. Vice Chair Rossmo commented on an article in the Austin American statesman that talked about these changes and how they will impact our tax rates. The City Manager was talking about a 5 percent tax increase. He does not understand the 5 percent tax jump. The only logical thought he can come to terms with is if we have decreasing crime rate and we have a certain growth of population with increasing money, Vice Chair Rossmo does not understand why we would have the need for a tax jump. The only option that makes sense is that police are being pulled away to participate in other activities that do not pertain to their core job functions such as special events. He thinks that they need to take a look at why and what the tax increase is going to. He is suggesting this for next month's recommendations to look at APD, AFD, and EMS. Start to look at the subsidization at special events that are increasing on drawing APD and EMS services. EMS does actually charge for special events. They are going to look at EMS for an example for the possible fees for APD to charge. EMS only charges if the event has a dedicated unit that is specifically for that event only. Commissioner Kent Anschutz suggests that we look at how other departments in other parts of the country gain revenue other than the general revenue from the cities. APD makes sure to maintain minimum staffing when they have to pull resources down during events. When APD has to pull resources down it's a combination of pulling in resources and overtimes dollars. Commissioner Ko stated that we not only need to look at per unit or per hour cost. We have to think about these types of spillover costs, these types of overhead; things that impact overall functioning of the department and maybe think about a general Public Safety fee that we have to charge for these events. The key here to keep in mind is that charging for just an additional unit does not capture true cost. Commissioner Moreno asked Chief Evans (AFD) if there is a similar response from the fire department on special events (i.e. overcrowding). Chief Evans commented that AFD is very similar to APD and EMS, we do have some unreimbursed costs. Commissioner Moreno asked if there any departments we would be able to model off of for recovery. Chief Evans took Commissioners Anschutz and Moreno's questions down so he could research other jurisdictions to see if there are other revenue sources. AFD has done it in years past, looked at different ways to raise revenue beyond the tax dollar, but at any particular juncture when you are gaining revenue someone is going to have to pay it and none of them are without challenges. Chief Evans stated that he will research the options and get back to the Commissioners. Vice Chair Rossmo stated that users of the service pay for the services. Chair Lauderdale voiced concern with providing adequate services and we will take position to say we need to spend more. We are asking you to advise us in ways in which we can make certain more of that burden is placed on those individuals that do use the services and I would add to that particularly when we begin to talk about staff the biggest part of the city's budget in terms of staff is public safety. So one of the things we would also ask you to advise us on is what are the kind of long-term implications if each of you adds one additional person we train them, we pay for their time when they are working with the dept., but then we are involved with their retirement, we are involved in their health care after retirement. We are asking you to come back in September so that we can look at those kinds of things: what are the direct costs, what the long-term costs are, and what way can we more fairly portion those cost to the individuals that use those costs Commissioner Ko commented on the need to look at public safety as a whole, not just fire, but also how it impacts EMS and the burden on tax payers.

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

Recommendation

Whereas the 2:1,000 ratio should be the minimum police staffing level in the City of Austin; and

Whereas the City Council-commissioned PERF report established the need for at least 92 more officers during the FY14 budget year; and

Whereas the City of Austin's population continues to grow rapidly; and

Whereas the current level of 15% uncommitted time is insufficient to apply the principles of community policing; and

Whereas a baseline of 25% uncommitted time is required to properly practice community policing; and

Whereas the principles of community policing should be practiced by all sworn Austin Police Department personnel; and

Whereas an additional 92 officers during the FY14 budget year would increase the safety of other APD officers and citizens; NOW, THEREFORE

BE IT RECOMMENDED BY THE CITY OF AUSTIN PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION:

The Public Safety Commission recommends the City Council approve 92 new Austin Police Department officer positions for the FY14 budget year and encourages the Council to consider an LGBT Community Liaison position to further build trust between the police and members of the LGBT community.

a. *Issues Surrounding EMS Services in Travis County – Danny Hobby, Travis County*

Chair Lauderdale introduced Danny Hobby, County Executive of Emergency Services from Travis County. Chair Lauderdale stated that we are going to look at EMS in the context of it being a public safety service. Different from fire, police; EMS serves within the limits of the city. We have a collateral relationship between the city of Austin and county. Chief Lauderdale asked Danny Hobby to brief the Commission on what is the county relationship. We live in Austin but are also residents of Travis County.

Danny Hobby commented that he comes here today bringing his own perspective, this is not the perspective or the opinions or the recommendations of the Travis County Commissioner Court. Please give me the opportunity to give you the perspective from the county side. Danny Hobby passed out a document he wrote entitled, Why Change? This document will basically tell you where we are in regards to discussion in the county. There are many stakeholders and we need to do this together in order for this to benefit residents who receive the care as well as the taxpayer that pays the cost. Understanding who are the

stakeholders? AFD, APD, EMS all interact in regards to what happens in the county. But there are also Emergency Service Districts (ESDs), those are very valuable to the county because they are geographically located to where we cannot possibly put different resources on every corner like in the city where you can; it is not financially feasible. The county depends on first responders; they used to be called Rural Fire Districts and are now ESDs. Most ESDs have paid staff and are not volunteers; because of this the ESD's are a very valuable tool. ESDs do very little fighting fires; unless we have a threat of wildfires. Most of the time, 75-80% of the time, they are medical first responders. When we talk about medical care in the county they are a valuable resource for our residents that live outside of the city of Austin and even inside the city of Austin. The perfect scenario would be no division of lines or patches; we would all be doing something together. Taxation is another issue we need to address as governments and as stakeholders or it will never get to where we want it get. His proposal to the Commission is to give thought to looking at an authority for public safety and that we have one tax and that we look at that as one tax to the taxpayer. In his opinion, right now if you are a city of Austin taxpayer (which Danny Hobby is) the taxpayer has a double taxation. But if you were looking at all the public safety agencies, we always need to stress unification; we need to do things together. One thing he has learned with his vast experience is to combine the city and county together. Combining saves money, but it also provides better service to our residents. He asked the same thing to be considered to emergency service districts. We can't ignore it, people are struggling and trying to make ends meet and the ESDs are trying to do the very best they can. However, the ESDs are not getting the support the need. We need to figure out how to participate all together because it is going to cost the city of Austin, the county and other stakeholders more and more money because we end up having to subsidize those services. He meets with a coalition of small cities every month as well as a coalition of commissioners from ESDs; for the purpose of trying to look at how we can participate together in improving service delivery to the community. So small cities are meeting for the first time to discuss how to jointly do things together and have contracts together. He introduced seven scenarios the county is looking at and reviewing. He does not endorse any one of the seven scenarios, except the one that brings all of us together. The first scenario is the one he has been spending time on; there are 14 emergency district services in the county and he is trying to unify those districts together, working with Chief Evans, Chief Shamard, and other chiefs. What is the county thinking? What is the county doing? The county is working on these seven scenarios. County Municipalities will continue to annex areas in the county causing more funding drain on the county and ESDs and even the city of Austin. Better coordination is needed in the future to limit the impact to those left after annexation. One particular district impacted by annexation, on a map used to be a complete horseshoe and now they are broken into five separate pieces. Are annexations wrong, no, they are a must and people are entitled to do them; but it's what is leftover with the annexation that we should be concerned about. That is what is costly not only to the resident but to the taxpayer and to us in government. County EMS stations have low utilization percentages with five out of ten stations below 10 percent utilization. The current zone work between the county and City of Austin can assist in establishing of better locations and hopefully a better use of county units. Danny has been criticized in the past for delaying resources into the county. He never intended to delay

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

resources into the county he just liked making a decision based on good justification before he did it. The reason why he was holding back resources was because of the zone work they had received that showed he had a tremendously low utilization. Yes, in the county where they are located you are going to have lower utilization than you would in the city, but below 10 percent; he feels like it is a need and Chief Shamard is going to work with him. They have permission from Deputy City Manager McDonald to now look at these stations and work with the small cities to see if we can't move them a couple of miles or move them where they are utilized better. This also means regionalization. This Commission could have great gain by looking at a regional approach rather than just a Travis County approach. He believes regionalization will happen. Ernie Rodriguez and Danny Hobby recently met with Burnet County to discuss an auto aid agreement. EMS ground units which are called on box alarms are demanding on county units which should be viewed to determine better utilizations are available or achievable. That has to do with the fact the when units are pulled into a fire, they need to be released if they are not needed and thrown back into the system and not just sitting there. The county has no ground advanced life support personnel except in ambulances and commander vehicles. ESD 6 is currently doing a part-time pilot that causes a lot of heartache because of putting paramedics out in the County. Paramedics are already in the County, but they are limited in being in ground units. Danny would like to work with the City to see if they could have some pilots. City of Austin EMS cost of services is a short-term and long-term concern for the County since there has been a three percent increase in salaries each year. EMS Paramedics recently achieved Civil Service status by the voters this past November. This change should increase salaries as a result of the FY 14 budget. This is one of the things that is difficult for Danny Hobby in dealing with Interlocal Agreement is that he never knows truly what the cost is going to be of the Interlocal Agreement because of how the negotiations time-lines is set. So right at this moment, he cannot tell the Commission what he is paying for the EMS Interlocal Agreement and as a result it's difficult for him to say what he is going to do in the future. What is he going to do as far as resources in the future when the cost is unknown. But he believes Chief Shamard is about to wrap that up, but again this is August and yet we are trying to work on an Interlocal Agreement together. The fiscal 14 Interlocal Agreement should be written as a performance based agreement not just financial and operational requirements. This is something the City agrees with and we are going to attempt that in this particular agreement. Now the question you may ask is, are you planning on doing and what is your recommendation going to be to the court in regards with going forward on this agreement. His recommendation is that he wants to go forward with the fiscal 14 agreement. He believes in the relationship, he believes in a long-term relationship. He believes in a relationship that is sharing and has a coordinated effort with each other. He has had a difficult time in the past in regards to getting information and being able to get in and really understand the budget. This past February he and Chief Shamard finally broke some ground together. To where we were actually able to bring in some outside resources, from the City and the County, sit in a room like this, and were able to break ground for the first time. We were able to agree about moving forward with the budget and break it out because under the formula budget neither side knew what the other was paying for and now we know we have a financial template. So as of about February we now see the relationship strengthening

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

between the City and the County in regards to what is we are doing with each other. It has been a hard battle on both sides of the fence, but especially on his side of the fence because when you don't know something or don't have access to the information then you begin to question it. Our need for change gives us the opportunity to improve the system by working together without the fear of change. He thinks together is the key word that he wants to leave with the Commission. We should review alternative methods of service to improve county medical response, ALS squads, auto aid on the borders, paramedics on engines in high service demand areas, if appropriate and we can justify it. Additionally, we should implement joint venture services, hazmat, auto aid, and systems data warehouses county-wide where possible. Together we can better serve our community. So he leaves that perspective with the Commission not to come here today blaming anybody but encouraging you as a Commission, when you talk about the county then include them, allow us in your discussions and he hopes that when he comes here again that we are trying to achieve something together and not separate. Chair Lauderdale asked Danny Hobby a question in terms of his presentation, when you talk about the emergency services districts we are talking about rural areas and small towns correct? Mr. Hobby answered anything outside the city of Austin and Travis County. Chair Lauderdale commented that the pattern is to combine fire and EMS in those organizations. Danny Hobby answered no to his question, what you will see under the scenarios, is you'll see there is a scenario that's being reviewed right now, for example you will see his gap plan. It's a five step gap analysis of where he goes through with each ESD and they first try to resolve their needs at the home level because that is where the service is being directly provided. Then they look at how they can look at funding. For example what kind of self-healing they can have. The second one is to see if they can go to the small city or if they are associated with a village then they need to go there and say you know what we need to sit a discussion on what our needs are. Third, is there some way they need to merge and combine to where they can have a greater efficiency in regards to consolidation. Fourth, go to the Austin Fire Department. We couldn't do anything without the Austin Fire Department because of the auto aid that exists, and he thinks Chief Evans will tell you it's a wonderful thing. The same goes for EMS, you barter services to where you don't have to build stations and buy equipment if you can simply borrow each other's. Fifth, come to the County, after you have tried the first four steps and we still can't meet our gap and ask what the County can do. Then that's where he steps in with the Commissioner's Court and make recommendations in regards to that. Commissioner Levy asked Mr. Hobby we do not have a contract yet? Mr. Hobby responded that we do not have a contract yet. Commissioner Levy stated that they had been told a couple of times that they do have a contract but if we don't have a contract how far away from having a contract. Mr. Hobby responded we do have a contract. We just approved amendment 5. So we have a contract in place as far as FY13, but if Commissioner Levy is referring to FY14 we are still in negotiations for that contract. Commissioner Levy asked that if we don't have a contract would there be an extension until the other one is negotiated? Mr. Hobby responded yes to Commissioner Levy's questions. Commissioner Levy pointed out in Danny Hobby's report; that they look at other service models that you would like to be able to consider and implement. Example: Paramedics on engine companies in the county. Is the city starting to become open to those new delivery models that you

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

would like to be able to add flexibility to consider? Danny Hobby's response is that he is not even sure we, the county, and the stakeholders, are even open to those. Those are being vetted and being reviewed. He thinks the City has offered to come to the table and initially they considered looking at ALS squads in fact the City would provide them. He believes EMS is open to at least ALS squads and looking at the benefit or the non-benefit of having squads out in the county. Now paramedics on engines, he doesn't have any great support for that in regards to the City, it is something the County is considering because ESDs must consider all options at this time.

Chair Lauderdale introduced Anthony Marquardt, President of the Austin-Travis County EMS Employees Association. Anthony first thanked the Commission for looking into EMS issues in the County. These issues seemed in the past to be beyond the purview of the Commission and it is encouraging that it may be considered looking at the other half of EMS's operations especially if you need to advise City Council how to move forward in other areas. One of the frustrations over the last eight months of trying to work with the county is actually having a full disclosure of these plans. He received scanned documents but essentially what we would want and expect from a professional agency that is volunteering its alternative services is a business operating plan with statistical analysis and a relative comparison of services. Currently none of that is provided and that is essential for moving forward and having variety of the bullet points listed on the document. I am very hopeful that we have moved on and looking forward to more research based and evidence based research while moving forward. These things taking place behind closed doors are disappointing. The community should have a forum that takes place to advise the community about items being proposed and who's proposing it and how they intend to be accountable for whatever plan they come up with. Some of the other things worth mentioning are the unification of the ESDs, and there is also a chance of a metropolitan AFD system (which he believes the fire association has put together the means of merging ESDs into the Austin Fire Department). Unification of ESDs is something he has yet to see a business operating plan for, he hopes to see one soon. Regarding the ALS personnel in the County and the low unit utilization, we need geographic coverage in Travis County. We are going to end up with ambulances that have less than 10 percent utilization, but by moving those in to a more strategic area within the response district he thinks we can provide a better service which is something within their means to do. If we are letting EMS management choose where these units are going and not leaving it to the ESD Chief's which has been the historic placement of EMS's ambulances. Which Pflugerville and Lago Vista are well out of the ideal response area. Any proposals that are recommended in the county that recommend reducing the EMS resources should be suspect. The three ambulances we did manage to get after a long struggle over eight months represents the ambulance we have needed for some time. First full-time ambulance added in over a decade to meet the needs of the growing population of Travis County. Moving forward and talking about different means of incorporating different municipalities should be additional resources not a reduction of resources trying to chase a utility model that tries to predict where calls will come from when you can't do that. It is clearly a model based on a metropolitan system, a large city when we know special events are in the area. We know when we can predict when we will need additional resources but you can't do that in geographical based coverage. Chair

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

Lauderdale asked Anthony, one of the things we have heard and we know you are farther along and this is more in the city than the count; is moving away from having two paramedics per ambulance and having a paramedic and a medical technician. Chair Lauderdale recently spoke to paramedics about, what would happen if one of you was a paramedic and one was a technician, and both paramedics said they were against that and that in most cases you need to have two paramedics. Chair Lauderdale asked Anthony what his opinion about moving away from having two paramedics. Anthony answered that the staffing issue is a topic that has clearly been discussed in this room. He believes it is a little misunderstood, what we are talking about is a medic 1 versus medic 2 program. So we are not talking about the difference between an EMT and a paramedic, we are talking about a medic 1 which is your entry-level position and he thinks EMS has more paramedics that go through than not and so that can be a double paramedic configuration. We would hope that our ideal would be a base line of paramedics for that position. We are not currently there yet so there are EMTs moving through the program with that we are hopeful we have a career path built out. Chair Lauderdale asked Anthony to give a little more detail about what you are talking about. Anthony is using terms that Chair Lauderdale doesn't quite understand. What are the two levels? Anthony began to clarify his meaning, having the medic 1 medic 2 system isn't necessarily a bad idea. We would hope that our ideal is to add a paramedic into that position. Chair Lauderdale asked if the Medic 1 is intended to be what with their training in regards to comparison to a medic 2. Anthony responded that the Medic 1 is the entry-level position. You have to start at medic 1 to move on to Medic 2. Commissioner Levy commented that a Medic 1 is basically an EMT. If they come in as a paramedic they are not certified to operate as a paramedic. Anthony explained that the Certification and credentialing are two different things. We are talking about credentialing. Our physician will credential the entry-level medic 1 to whatever the physician (Dr. Hinchey) is comfortable with the practice. Commissioner Moreno asked what would be a prerequisite, what level, entry-level? Anthony responded the entry-level is you have to have a minimal certification as an EMT to apply to work for Austin Travis County EMS. We are hopeful that we are attracting paramedics as well to fill that position and building up a career path to evolve in the future. Commissioner Moreno asked you don't have to be a paramedic to gain entry into EMS? Anthony responded no to Commissioner Moreno's question. Commissioner Moreno asked so that would be the medic 1 version. Anthony responded yes. Commissioner Anschutz commented that he thinks they have a semantics problem here. He asked Anthony to just assume we don't know what the different levels are. Anthony commented the minimum you can do for an EMT is the 8 week training course. Chief Shamard clarified that it's typically a one semester course at ACC but it is noninvasive procedures. Chair Lauderdale asked if an EMT is also called a medic 1? Anthony responded no, he was explaining what the difference is. A Medic 1 can be either an EMT or a Paramedic. The EMT is the entry-level it is lesser trained. The paramedic level is a two year degree starting out. Paramedic has significant more training and with that certification typically a year approved for ALS skills. Commissioner Levy commented to Anthony, so basically what you are saying is there is always going to be an ALS certified personnel on the unit and there may or may not be an ALS credentialed personnel on the unit? Anthony responded yes that would be ideal, to Commissioner Levy. Commissioner Levy followed up by asking Anthony

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

if the ideal is to have one paramedic and one non paramedic. Anthony responded that the ideal is to maintain an ALS presence on all calls. Commissioner Levy commented that historically we have had two higher credential providers on each unit and basically we are no longer mandating that as a standard. So we can no longer state we have two ASL credentialed providers per each unit? Anthony responded, yes that's right. Commissioner Anschutz asked Anthony, so forget medic 1 and medic 2, are those designations by the department as to employee designations. Is that what those terms mean? Commissioner Anschutz clarified that he believes the change proposed is to go from two paramedics to one paramedic and one EMT. Anthony responded that yes that is the change proposed. One of the hard things to talk about when talking about this entry-level is there is potential for this program. It does have some positives that create accountability on each ambulance. Whereas the system before we have both members equally accountable which leads to its own issues. Commissioner Anschutz commented that one of the points Dr. Hinchey made, that it provides training for the lesser educated person and you don't have people of equal training and education at odds during a decision. It also provides a career track for the EMT level individual. Chair Lauderdale asked Chief Evans and Ronaldo if fire personnel were also first responders. Chief Evans answered yes fire personnel are first responders. Chair Lauderdale commented that frequently, he will see a fire truck get to a site before an EMS vehicle does. Chair Lauderdale asked how are the fire personnel trained with regards to being first responders in medical emergencies? Chief Evans responds with, you are always going to get an EMT. There are also a number of paramedics in the Austin Fire Department but they are not credentialed to practice which is the point Anthony was making earlier. So, they aren't doing the ALS maneuvers because that is provided by EMS credentialed providers. Commissioner Moreno commented that fire personnel also won't have the equipment that a paramedic will have. Chief Evans stated that we support EMS with the first response. Chair Lauderdale asked how did that come about; were there not enough fires going on due to building codes? And so, you had an expansion of mission in the fire department? Chief Evans stated that the evolution of that service is decades and decades old. Probably predates the 70s where there was a need for the medical first response for street medicine for pre-hospital medicine and the fire service became involved in it. AFD chose not to take the ALS roles so we have always provided the medical first response and the transport and ALS supports has been provided by EMS since the mid-70s. Chair Lauderdale asked if that is that an Austin pattern or a nationwide pattern? How do we compare with other cities? Chief Evans stated that there are about five to six different models that could be used. Fire based EMS systems, separate agencies like ATCEMS, private agencies like Arcadian. It really depends on the jurisdiction and how our resources are spread out. Commissioner Ko commented to Anthony that there are a couple of take a ways he is hearing, 1) whether your educated as a paramedic versus an EMT isn't necessarily the same as being credentialed as a paramedic and EMT. So just because someone is a Medic 1 they could be a qualified paramedic, but because of the way the system is set up they are not going to be credentialed to do so. So under the shift to this proposed new staffing arrangement of the ambulances what Commissioner Ko is hearing from Anthony is that from the Association's standpoint there are pluses and minuses, but something you definitely don't want to see is the policy used as an excuse to go to that minimum only one paramedic arrangement per unit. Anthony

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

responded that was absolutely correct. Commissioner Levy doesn't understand the explanation just given. Commissioner Ko responded that the concern is by switching to the staffing system, you don't want to use that new staffing system as an excuse to go down to a minimum of one paramedic on every unit. Commission Levy responded but that's what they are doing. And they are doing it without assurances that were given both to the Commission and the City Council that would be limited to only four inter-city stations as a trial. Then they were supposed to come back to the Council and the Commission with their findings. Right now, they are expanding it out to just about all units not all but to most stations. Commissioner KO's commented that for the transparency piece we need to know that for those stations that EMS is proposing or already shifting to this model, what are the actual qualifications (not credentials) of the people being put to staff on these ambulances because we need to see if there is a pattern towards using this to hold down the number of paramedics we're getting on ambulances. Commissioner Levy said to keep in mind even if they are trained as paramedics if they are not credentialed they are limited to basic skills.

Commissioner Ko commented to Chief Shamard that this might be something we would like to look at as a Commission; so in areas where you have been experimenting with this new staffing model it would be helpful to know what exactly are the qualifications of the people and how the staffing is being arranged. Chief Shamard commented that he is not completely sure he understands the questions, but we do have ambulances with medic 1s and medic 2s. The medic 2s are always credentialed and working paramedics and the medic 1s are credentialed by the medical director at a lower practice level, but that may or may not be a certified or licensed paramedics. Anthony commented that with evidenced based, he thinks this conversation fell by the wayside a year ago and we have all moved on. We need to build a viable plan that is evidence based research. Commissioner Moreno asked are we the only current major city in Texas that has both fire and EMS as a city department, correct? Chief Evans listed a few fire based cities: Dallas, Houston, San Antonio, and El Paso. Commissioner Moreno commented that we are the unique one in that we have three different entities as far as municipal employees, but we are also unique because we also service the county as municipal employees. With each entity working on collective bargaining, the employee associations will hammer out the details and changes. We also somewhat have a county delivery service through EMS; Fire doesn't because we have automatic aid and law enforcement doesn't because we have the sheriff's departments. Have there been discussions with employee association with how that is going to be with the civil service status of the municipal employees? Chief Shamard commented that because we're negotiating Police, Fire, and EMS contracts this year it is especially difficult. Once we have the contract in place we will know each year of the contract for the most part what the incremental increases will be so it will be easier to project a budget in advance. And how we are servicing the county is through an interlocal agreement with the City of Austin. All the employees are part of the EMS Department and the County and City have an interlocal agreement for EMS to provide EMS service into the County. So yes since we are still negotiating our labor contract we are unable to provide the county the complete cost of EMS service because the personnel staff for EMS is still a work in progress. Commissioner Moreno asked what's negotiated is the deliverable service for municipal employees. Have

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

there been any conversations about delivering services to the county? Chief Shamard answered it's the same people and the same services with one service model. We have a group of ambulances and commanders that are located all over Austin and Travis County that respond to 911 calls when they come in we don't have County employees and City employees. They are all City employees that are all under the meet and confer labor contract with the Association and those employees may be stationed one day in Lago Vista and the next day in Pflugerville and then the next day in Austin. Commissioner Moreno asked can you speak to that as far as some of the paramedics you represent when negotiating with the City but also responding to the county where there is another management system in place. Do you have any say in those policies? Anthony responded, no those decisions take place with the ESD Chiefs, Danny Hobby and negotiations with EMS staff. That is not an Association area. We do negotiate a contract which is applicable to how we operate within the City and the County. Commissioner Levy commented that Anthony used the word experiment but they are rolling it out and there never was a pilot. Commissioner Rossmo feels a certain amount of frustration; we have been dealing with EMS issues for some time. A lot of this stuff is pretty complex and it's hard to know how to proceed. Regionalization saves money and increases efficiencies and it should be explored but it reaches a level of complexity that makes us flounder and we don't know what to do. In terms of EMS are there any specific recommendations we can give to City Council that might be progressive that people might agree would be a way to move forward. Commissioner Levy asked Danny Hobby if those seven were options are for the County. Danny Hobby commented that a few are not and that he hopes the Commission does not make a recommendation because those seven options have not been vetted yet in regards to the reviews.

Danny Hobby reiterated that the reason he is here today is to let the Commission know that he is there for discussion. This will allow more transparency. It's good to have good continued dialog. Out of those seven ideas, there are some for the city, some with AFD, some with small cities, and some for the County. Anthony commented to Vice Chair Rossmo that he sent Vice Chair Rossmo the Management Advisory Groups EMS Study that took place in 2011 by Travis County. What he asked of Vice Chair Rossmo was to compare that with RFS which is the deliverables that were supposed to be met and did EMS meet them. Vice Chair Rossmo commented that we need to make real recommendations to City Council to have any real power or talk to the media. We need to figure out if there are improvements and things that should change in EMS and that is what we should recommend to City Council. The Commission could recommend to City Council that a study needs to be done, like the PERF Analysis. Danny Hobby mentioned that they do have an EMS Advisory Board. Danny Hobby recommends that Vice Chair Rossmo recommend that we activate the Joint Task Force Committee again. This would be a group could talk about EMS and any city/county issue. Commissioner Levy advised that he would strongly recommend that as part of our recommendation to Council would be examining potential consolidation of EMS service under fire and not having two works group; Paramedic workgroup and Fire workgroup working under one management to take advantage of resources that are not being used right now; but also getting more efficiency and having dollars freed up for other Public Safety agencies such as Police and Fire. This would be looking for maximum efficiency.

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

Vice Chair Rossmo wants to make this a September agenda item; he wants to know the right types of information to help them move forward. He would define the agenda item as, Ideas for Improvements for EMS and the Commission can look at them to figure out what recommendation to make to City Council. Commissioner Levy believes Danny Hobby, Anthony Marquardt and Chief Evans should be present for the discussion in September. Commissioner Ko seconded the agenda item for September.

- b. Chair Lauderdale introduced Cary Grace, Assistant City Attorney; she will be discussing open records and new legislation. During this past session, the Legislature passed a number of open government related bills. Some amended the open meetings act and some amended the open records act. Some but not all affect municipalities. These bills do two things: they add new tools to the Open Meetings Act for governing bodies to utilize. Those include video conferencing during public meetings and an on-line message board option. The other bill specifically amends the definition in the Public Information Act on what constitutes public information. The video conference bills, HB2414 and SB984, both permit governmental bodies to conduct meeting through video conference if certain minimum standards are met. Although these two bills differ slightly, they both generally permit a governmental body to conduct meeting by video conference if the meeting is accessible to the public at an appropriate physical location where the person presiding over the meeting is actually physically there and the other participants in the meeting must visible and audible to the public. HB2414 has one extra requirement; it requires members of the public who are in attendance in that meeting room be able to participate on the same bases as if the meeting were held without the video conference. For example, still be able to participate in the citizen communications and ask questions. The online message board bills are SB1297 and HB2414. HB2414 adds both of those tools; it adds the video conferencing option for governing bodies and it adds the on-line messaging board provision. HB2414 was effective on June 14, 2013; SB1297 will not be effective until Sept 1, 2013. HB2414 provisions are available now. The new online message board bill provisions provide specifically that members of a governing body may communicate in writing through an online message board. So long as the message board is linked to the governmental body's website and available to the public in real time. Other requirements are as follows: the communication must be displayed on the online message board for not less than 30 days after the communication is first posted. And very importantly the governmental body may have only one online message board and it must be controlled and owned by the governmental body and prominently displayed on the body's primary internet website. The message board may be used only by members of that governing body or staff members of the body who have received specific authorization to do that. Further messages that are removed from the online message board must be maintained for six years and the postings once removed are subject to the Public Information Act in other words they are always made public if asked. And finally the governmental body cannot vote or take action through the message board. The second topic you asked is SB1368 and some of the provisions do not apply to city entities just to the state. So the provisions that are important amend the definition of the Public Information Act of what is public information and clarify that emails, text messages, instant messages and other electronic communications that concern official business are public

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

information and the public's right of access to that information is governed by the Public Information Act. This bill makes very clear that this is true even if a particular employee or official maintains the responsive communication on a purely personal device (e.g. iPhone) and even via a purely personal service provider. Put another way this definitional language codifies the Attorney General's legal position that it's the content of a communication that determines whether it is Public Information under the statute. If the communication concerns official business (this is a new definition) then those communications are subject to the Public Information Act even if the communication is maintained by and is accessible to only one individual employee or official. This codification basically in keeping with the Attorney General's long-standing interpretation of the existing definition in the statute as it relates to traditional paper copies of government records. So even when an original paper government record has been held for a long time and it's been in the possession of one employee or official, the record still meets the definition of public information and the public's right of access is governed by the statute. At the direction of City Council city staff has created social media guidelines for the city's boards and commissions. These guidelines are found in a particular administrative bulletin (AB08-05). The guidelines prohibit individual boards and commission members from participating in posting or discussion threads on social media sites created and maintained by the board you are a member of. So boards wishing to initiate social media sites must do so by formal action of the board and follow other requirements that are laid out in the AB08-05, including approval by the City's Chief Communications Director and Web Content Manager in advance of creating the site. Also at the direction of City Council the City Clerk developed a policy that governs the conduct of the board and commission members and conducting board business by e-mail. That policy is codified in the City Code at section 2-1-49. The ordinance requires board members to use the city e-mail account provided by the City Clerk for all electronic communications related to the member's service on the board. Further a board member is required to promptly forward related communications he receives in a personal e-mail account to the city e-mail account whenever that occurs.

Chair Lauderdale addressed Commissioner KO, stating that he knows he has a recommendation. Commissioner Ko passed out handouts to the Commission. He is impressed by the data he's seen on early youth violence intervention programs and the way that can really target some of our most vulnerable population the people that are most likely to turn into career criminals and really divert that a way. We are seeing more and more reliance on the court system to try to deal with youth and delinquency in a comprehensive way. The reality is the criminal justice system and the court system is not the ideal place to be doing that. We are not equipped to provide that type of comprehensive response. He would like to encourage the City Council to look at funding programs that do this type of youth violence prevention. Commissioner Ko wanted to make sure if we do pass this resolution it does not come at the expense of public safety funds that are intended or designed for other purposes.

Commissioner Ko introduced Mr. Cobb. He is board member of Travis County District Attorney and he has been a prosecutor for 23 years. These kinds of programs are needed for the city. If you are going to spend money you need to spend money on these programs. These programs divert kids from committing crimes and our society is benefitted as a whole. It saves money by spending it up front. It will keep kids from going to prison. Asking for

For more information on the Public Safety Commission, please contact Austin Police Department Chief of Staff, David Carter at (512) 974-5030. The City of Austin is committed to compliance with the American with Disabilities Act. Reasonable modifications and equal access to communications will be provided upon request. Meeting locations are planned with wheelchair access. If requiring Sign Language Interpreters or alternative formats, please give notice at least 4 days before the meeting date. Please call Tara Long at the Austin Police Department, at (512) 974-5747, for additional information; TTY users route through Relay Texas at 711.

these kinds of programs is cost effective. Our juvenile delinquents are a public health problem and preventing the crime from happening.

Chair Lauderdale seconded the recommendation.

5. Discussion Regarding Potential Future Agenda Items

- Discussion about existing mental health services, community and agency needs, future plans with speakers from the Austin Travis County Integral Care, Garrett Olin (Director of Homeless Management Information Systems), Richard Troxell (House the Homeless), Janette Kinard (Director of the Travis County Mental Health Public Defender Office), Michelle Hallee (Travis County DA Prosecutor), Christopher Ziebell (Chief of Service for Brackenridge Hospital) with briefing from APD about the cost of police services for community members living with mental and emotional health conditions
- Periodic Report on ARIC Operations
- Presentation from the City's Special Events Coordinator
- Early Crime Intervention Programs
- Alternative Funding for Police Services
- Downtown Crime Patterns and Trends
- EMS Interlocal Agreement
- Commission Recommendation to City Council for PERF-style review of EMS
- Pedestrian Fatalities and Related Programming/Funding Needs
- Presentation on False Confession – Related Issues
- Demand for APD personnel Downtown
- 9-1-1 Call Center Staffing
- Identity Theft Overview
- Police Call Load Changes over the Past Five Years
- Resource and Financial Impact of Special Events on Public Safety Departments
- Overview of Crimes Involving an LGBTQ Victim

6. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn by Commissioner Moreno, seconded by Commissioner Anschutz. Meeting adjourned at 6:05 p.m.