HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

DECEMBER 14, 2015

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

C14H-1979-0013

Green Pastures 811 W. Live Oak Street

PROPOSAL

Modifications to the house and the non-historic "garden room" addition; construct a new free-standing pavilion in the rear side yard with an attached restroom structure.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The applicant proposes the construction of a new one-story addition to the side of the house, which will require small, selective areas of demolition, and the reconfiguration of the doors and windows of an existing historic addition, which will become the principal entry to the new proposed hotel reception area. The principal house will remain unchanged, but the existing addition to the west of the main house will be reconfigured to have the entrance open to the north rather than to the west. The set of 4 windows along the north elevation will be replaced with a door with flanking windows, which will match the existing windows in the addition. A new one-story office addition will be made to the west of the new hotel reception area – it will be one-story with a weathered cedar rain screen and painted steel columns. A new wood deck is proposed for the entry into the reception area of the hotel on the north and west elevations of the house.

The existing non-historic covered walkway on the north elevation of the house will be removed to shift the public entry to the house to the east elevation. Salvaged railing will be installed at the north entry to form a continuous porch railing. The applicant further proposes a one-story kitchen addition to the southwest corner of the house. This addition will have a flat roof and grooved siding to match the existing siding on the building.

The guardrail on the second story of the east elevation of the house will be modified to meet current Code.

At the "garden room" addition, the applicant proposes to remove the existing lattice at the crawlspace of the non-historic addition to the rear of the structure, and install new stucco skirting. The existing windows will be replaced with multi-light casement windows. There will be a new steel guard rail at the back of the "garden room" addition.

The proposed free-standing open-air pavilion will be constructed of painted steel columns and will have a tensile fabric roof, pitched in a pyramidal tent shape. The pavilion will have a flat-roofed entry porch and a flat-roofed restroom to the rear. The pavilion will have painted steel columns and a roof truss system that is complementary to the railing design on the existing historic house. The restroom will have stucco siding with metal screens for ventilation at the top of the walls. At the top of the walls of the pavilion and at the flat-roofed entry porch, the applicant proposes cast iron cresting.

In addition, the applicant proposes sitework to the property, including new walkways and an open patio on the south side.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Commission's Standards for Review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness include:

• Do not destroy the distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Avoid the removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features.

- Recognize all buildings, structures, and sites as products of their own time. Do not
 construct alterations which have no historical basis and which seek to create an
 earlier appearance.
- Repair, rather than replace deteriorated architectural features wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Base the repair or replacement of missing architectural features on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties are appropriate when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historic, architectural, or cultural material and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.
- Construct new additions or alterations to structures in such a manner that if such addition or alteration were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure will be unimpaired.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee carefully reviewed the proposal over several meetings and provided a recommendation for approval with the condition that columns from the covered walkway be salvaged and stored, and a recommendation against the cresting proposed for the new pavilion, and recommended using a detail from the house as ornamentation rather than the proposed cresting.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the approval of the project as proposed with the cresting. Staff understands the Committee's hesitation about the inclusion of the cresting on the new pavilion, but staff agrees with the applicant's reasoning that the cresting will be appropriate for this Victorian-era property. Because the cresting is proposed for the new pavilion, there is no historical conflict, and cresting was an ornamental detail that was common to many houses of this style at the time. Staff's only concern is about the proposed increase in the height of the guardrail on the second story of the house, and would recommend that the applicant reconsider raising the guardrail height as historic landmarks may be exempt from Code regulations if it would impugn the historical integrity of the house.