From:

Paul Robbins

To:

Paul Robbins

Cc:

A. Bryan Stevenson; Alfred Herrera; Alfred Herrera; Alfred Herrera; Rose, Andrea; Barry Dreyling; Betty
Dunkerley; Carol S. Birch; Charles Girard; Christopher Hughes; Clarence Johnson; Clifford G. Wells; Cyrus Reed;
Ed Latson; Gerald Davis; Hannah Wilchar; Janee Briesemeister; Rate Review; Jill Penna; Lara, Jose; John B.
Coffman; John Sutton; Kaiba White; Lanetta Cooper; Laurie Barker; Maria Faconti; Maureen Whitfield; Michael J.
Whellan; Michael W. Rollins; Nathan Simpson; Paul Canduro; Randy Chapman; Rebecca Melancon; Roger

AUSTIN EHERGY

Borgelt; Tanya Leisey; Thomas Brocato; Trey Salinas; W. Scott McCollough

Subject: Date: Response to AE"s Objection and Motion to Strike Portions of Direct Testimony of Paul Robbins

Wednesday, May 18, 2016 10:50:03 AM

## **AUSTIN ENERGY 2016 RATE REVIEW**

AUSTIN ENERGY'S TARIFF PACKAGE UPDATE OF THE 2009 COST OF SERVICE STUDY AND PROPOSAL TO CHANGE BASE ELECTRIC RATES

BEFORE THE CITY OF AUSTIN

IMPARTIAL HEARINGS EXAMINER

Response to AE's Objection and Motion to Strike Portions of Direct Testimony of Paul Robbins

Judge Herrera and Parties,

This reply is in response to AE's motion to strike part of my May 3 testimony.

One of my contentions is that the utility owned property that was transferred to the City of Austin General Fund without compensation, and that the General Fund should compensate AE for imprudent use of assets.

AE replied that any property transfers that took place prior to the 2009 test year for the 2012 rate case were no longer relevant because they had, de facto, already been ruled upon.

I again state my disagreement with this. Unless AE can show me where these specific properties were ruled upon in the last rate case, I still consider them relevant.

I remind AE and all parties that there was no way for me to officially intervene in

an formal evidentiary hearing process in the last rate case, and no chance for discovery.

Sincerely,

Paul Robbins (512) 447-8712