

City Manager Recruitment

City Council Update
Human Resources Department
January 31, 2017

Background/Purpose

* December 2016

- City Council received a briefing from the Human Resources and Purchasing departments and a recommendation to hire Ralph Andersen & Associates
- Council provided direction to cancel the Request for Qualification Statements
- Council requested staff research and assess:
 - 1) The top executive recruiting firms who are private-sector focused
 - 2) The feasibility of co-managing or sub-contracting using two firms – one public-sector focused and one private-sector focused
 - 3) Any additional recommendations based on those findings

Methodology

Identifying Top Private Sector Firms

- * Survey sources were researched to identify private-sector focused firms
- * Twelve executive recruiting firms were identified and contacted
 - The four firms discussed by Council:
Korn Ferry, Russell Reynolds, Heidrick & Struggles and Spencer Stuart
 - Additional firms were identified using the survey sources

Information Packet

- * **Packet of Information Emailed on 12/15/16 included:**
 - City Manager job description
 - Background information sheet with a link to the City Council discussion on December 8, 2016.
 - Council Document - 'Elements of Engagement' for the search process
 - Summary of information regarding recruitment needs.

Information Packet

* **Asked each of the firms these questions:**

- Would your firm be interested in submitting a proposal to lead this recruitment?
- Would your firm be willing to co-manage this recruitment?
- Would your firm be willing to subcontract/be a subcontractor of another firm?
- Would your firm be willing to work in joint partnership with a public-sector focused firm?

Responses

- * Four private-sector focused firms submitted proposals
 - Russell Reynolds*, Heidrick & Struggles*, Transearch ,The Reagen Group
- * One public-sector focused/private-sector focused joint proposal received
 - GovHR and Transearch
- * Criteria used for assessing the proposals
 - Recruitment process/approach
 - Stakeholder community engagement
 - Engaging the public
 - Potential recruitment timeline
 - Profile of the individual(s) who would be conducting the search
 - References provided
 - Costs

Options for Consideration

- * Hire Ralph Andersen & Associates (Public-sector focused)
(Original recommendation)
- * Hire based on joint proposal from GovHR (Public-sector focused)
& Transearch (Private-sector focused)
- * Hire Russell Reynolds (Private-sector focused)

Analysis

	Ralph Andersen & Associates	GovHR/Transearch	Russell Reynolds
Recruitment Process/ Approach	Provides a team of resources to ensure deliverables are met. Client-focused process to establish candidate qualifications. A combination of marketing and personal outreach used for effective executive recruitment.	Has a six-phase recruitment methodology that includes engagement of stakeholders for profile development and outreach to a diverse and extensive network of public, private and non-profit sector professionals.	Has a four-phase approach to their search process. Provides formal report prior to finalizing the candidate profile. Uses network resources and personal contacts.
Addressing Community Stakeholders	Extensive experience in all aspects of the recruitment process including focus groups of internal/external stakeholders.	<u>GovHR</u> : Extensive experience in all aspects of the recruitment process including focus groups of internal/external stakeholders. <u>Transearch</u> : No reported experience on community engagement	Limited experience. Indicated willing to do as needed.
Engaging the Public	Extensive experience . Has used online surveys and other processes to get public input.	<u>GovHR</u> : Extensive experience . Has used online surveys and other processes to get public input. <u>Transearch</u> : No reported experience	Minimal experience: only in initial stage of recruitment process

Analysis

	Ralph Andersen & Associates	GovHR/Transearch	Russell Reynolds
Profiles of Search Team	Project Director and 5 member support team identified. Project Director - 20+ years experience. Support team - each member has a specialty focus (Research, Social media, etc.)	Two-member team with 17 years experience in public and private-sector placements. Their combined experience includes municipal government and private industry executive positions.	Two member team identified. Lead consultant - 30+ years experience: responsible for Houston & Dallas offices. Assisting consultant - 15 years experience.
References	References were from comparable municipalities; five City Manager recruitments	<u>GovHR</u> : References were from a diverse listing of municipalities & non-profits. <u>Transearch</u> : References were from Universities & private companies	References were from universities, Houston, and private industry executive positions
Estimated Cost	\$68,000 Fee, plus expenses	\$74,000 Fee, plus expenses	One-third of actual cash compensation (estimated \$118,000). Plus an additional flat cost recovery fee of \$4800 and expenses

Recruitments

	Ralph Andersen & Associates	GovHR	Transearch	Russell Reynolds
Current/Previous City Manager Recruitment	Numerous City Manager and City Administrator. Chief Executive Officer/Executive Vice President	Numerous City Manager and City/County Administrator.	No City Manager. Numerous Chief Executive Officer/Executive Director/President.	No City Manager. Numerous Chief Executive Officer/President.
Current/Previous Public Sector Recruitment	Municipalities, Counties, State Agencies, Universities	Municipalities, Counties	Non-Profit, Universities	City of Houston, State Agencies, Non-Profits, Universities
Recent Recruitments	President/CEO, San Antonio Housing Authority (current)	City Manager, Cambridge, Massachusetts (2016)	President, Lemonade Day Nonprofit (2016)	Provost, UT Arlington (current)
	Public Works Director, City of Austin (2017)	ICMA, Exec. Dir (2016)	COO, Borbet Automotive (Manufacturing) (2016)	Chief of Police, City of Houston (2016)
	City Manager, Charlotte, NC (2016)	County Administrator, Marion County, FL (2015)	President/CEO, Energistics Nonprofit (2015)	President, UT Dallas (2016)
	City Manager, City of Sacramento, CA (2016)	City Manager, Ferguson, Missouri (2015)	Director of Engineering, Texas A&M, Kingsville (2016)	CEO, KBR, Inc. (formerly Kellogg, Brown and Root) (2014)

Options for Consideration

- * Hire Ralph Andersen & Associates (Public-sector focused)
(Original recommendation)
- * Hire based on joint proposal from GovHR (Public-sector focused)
& Transearch (Private-sector focused)
- * Hire Russell Reynolds (Private-sector focused)

City Manager Recruitment

Questions?