

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
DECEMBER 11, 2017
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
 C14H-1975-0010
 1607 San Jacinto Boulevard
 Scholz Garten
STAFF REPORT RE: REVISED PLANS

PROPOSAL

Make alterations to the historic building, including replacement of the main entrance awning, removal of a non-original awning on a secondary elevation, and replacement of non-original material on the rear elevation; also replace the one-story rear stage structure with a two-story building.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The applicant is proposing the following work:

- 1) Replace the main entrance awning on the primary (west) façade with a smaller awning;
- 2) Remove a non-original awning on the north elevation;
- 3) Replace non-original windows on the rear (east) elevation with pivot steel-sash windows and French doors;
- 4) Replace deteriorated wood posts supporting existing rear awning with ornamental steel posts;
- 5) Replace the picket fence screening rooftop mechanical equipment with a light gauge metal screen;
- 6) Uncover and restore an existing skylight;
- 7) Demolish the existing stage structure in the rear; and
- 8) Construct a new two-story building containing a stage and restrooms at the rear. The building will be clad in board and batten hardiboard siding and capped by a standing-seam metal gable roof with simple wood brackets at the apex and sides. The north elevation at the second story will include a band of fixed steel-sash windows and a pair of divided-light glazed steel doors opening onto a metal balcony. The second story will be accessed via an exterior metal staircase on the east side.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are used to evaluate proposed changes to historic landmarks. The standards applicable to this project include:

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The proposed project does not alter character-defining features, spaces, or spatial relationships. It proposes a smaller awning at the main entrance than the existing awning, which appears to be a replica of the original awning. However, photos show that smaller awnings have existed over the entrance in the past (see ca. 1960s and 1965 photos included in submitted plans).

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The proposed changes do not create a false sense of historical development.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

Historic materials such as brick masonry cladding, wood-sash windows, and brick ornamentation will be preserved. The awnings that are proposed to be removed and/or replaced and the windows that are proposed to be replaced on the rear elevation are all non-original.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed new stage building in the rear has forthright massing and a simple gable roof. It is differentiated from the historic building in terms of style, form, siding, and fenestration. However, the height of the building, the band of glazing at the second story, deep eaves, and brackets compete with the north elevation of the historic building and are not compatible with it.

The project complies with most of the applicable standards. The stage building faces 17th Street and is incompatible with a secondary but public elevation of the historic building.

COA COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The committee recommended that the replacement awning be enlarged to match the existing. The applicant believes that the smaller awning will provide a less intrusive view of the painted Scholz Garten sign and notes that a smaller awning existed in 1965.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the portions of the project on the historic building and site work; refer the new stage building to the Certificates of Appropriateness Review Committee for recommendations and then return to the full commission for approval.

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Photos



Primary (west) façade.



Detail of primary façade.



North elevation.



Rear of site, with stage structure at left.