

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
DECEMBER 17, 2018
PERMITS IN NATIONAL REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICTS
NRD-2018-0052
1002 CHARLOTTE STREET
CLARKSVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

PROPOSAL

Demolish a one-story house built ca. 1948 and construct a 2-story house in its place.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story, side-gabled, rectangular-plan house built in the Minimal Traditional style; clad in wood siding with 1:1 double-hung wood-sash windows.

RESEARCH

The house was constructed around 1948 for Isabel M. and Janie S. Sifuentez, who lived there until about 1965. Isabel worked various blue-collar jobs at Austin Baking. After the Sifuentezes moved out, a series of renters occupied the house for a few years at a time. Reflecting the humble character of the house, the occupants worked variously as a waitress, an Avon sales representative, and a nurse.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

Construct a 2-story house with Gothic Revival and Storybook influences. The proposed house will be clad in wood siding and feature single-hung and fixed clad-wood windows. It will be set back 31' from the sidewalk and will have a footprint of approximately 1,200 square feet. Prominent features and ornamentation include an entry porch with arched entrances, a wraparound screened porch, Gothic arch windows at the second story set in arched dormers, and gingerbread trim.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The house is a contributing property in the Clarksville Historic District. It does not appear to meet the standards for designation as a historic landmark.

Designation Criteria—Historic Landmark

- 1) The building is more than 50 years old, having been constructed ca. 1948.
- 2) The building retains a high degree of integrity.
- 3) Properties must meet two historic designation criteria for landmark designation (City of Austin Land Development Code (Section 25-2-352)). The property does not appear to demonstrate significance according to any of the criteria.
 - a. **Architecture.** The building is an intact example of the Minimal Traditional style, but does not appear to be architecturally significant.
 - b. **Historical association.** Isabel and Janie Sifuentez lived in the house for at least forty years. However, there do not appear to be significant historical associations.
 - c. **Archaeology.** The property was not evaluated for its potential to yield significant data concerning the human history or prehistory of the region.
 - d. **Community value.** The property does not appear to possess a unique location, physical characteristic, or significant feature that contributes to the character, image, or cultural identity of the community, Austin, or Texas as a whole.

- e. **Landscape feature.** The property is not a significant natural or designed landscape with artistic, aesthetic, cultural, or historical value to the city.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are used to evaluate projects in National Register historic districts. The following standards apply to the proposed new building:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

When evaluated in the context of the Clarksville Historic District, the proposed building is differentiated from the surrounding historic buildings by its size, complex massing, substantial porch, and lavish Gothic/Storybook ornamentation. Nearby historic-age buildings are one story high, with simpler massing and little ornamentation that reflect the area's working-class African American history. The proposed building will be out of character with the area and convey a false sense of history.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

If the proposed building were to be removed, the form and integrity of the historic area would be unimpaired.

The proposed project is not in keeping with the standards.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

Retain the existing building. Redesign the new building with a design more appropriate to the district, as the proposed design is historically referential but does not reflect the particular history of Clarksville. At minimum, scale back the Gothic elements.

No changes have been made to the proposed plans.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Encourage rehabilitation and adaptive re-use of the existing building, including consideration of a demolition delay, as the building is contributing to the historic district. Encourage relocation over demolition. If the Commission votes to release the demolition permit, then staff recommends completion of a City of Austin Documentation Package, consisting of photographs of all elevations, a dimensioned sketch plan, and a narrative history, for archiving at the Austin History Center.

Due to the building's location in a National Register historic district, the Commission must review and comment on the proposed plans for new construction prior to the release of the demolition permit. If the Commission votes to approve the demolition permit application, staff recommends that it recommend that the applicant consider a more restrained, modest design to better reflect the working-class history of Clarksville and the character of the neighborhood. The Commission may comment on the plans now or request that the applicant return to a future hearing with revised plans.

LOCATION MAP



-  SUBJECT TRACT
-  PENDING CASE
-  ZONING BOUNDARY

1" = 250'

NOTIFICATIONS

CASE#: NRD-2018-0052
LOCATION: 1002 CHARLOTTE ST



This product is for informational purposes and may not have been prepared for or be suitable for legal, engineering, or surveying purposes. It does not represent an on-the-ground survey and represents only the approximate relative location of property boundaries.

This product has been produced by CTM for the sole purpose of geographic reference. No warranty is made by the City of Austin regarding specific accuracy or completeness.

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Photos



Primary (east) façade and south elevation of 1002 Charlotte Street.

Occupancy History

City directory research, Austin History Center
 By Historic Preservation Office staff
 August 2018

- 1947 Address not listed
- 1949-65 Isabel M. and Janie S. Sifuentes, owners
 Various jobs at Austin Baking, including helper (1952-55), baker (1957), and
 machine operator (1961-65)
- 1968 Ernestin C. Walker, renter
 Waitress, Jim's Bar
- 1971-77 Henrietta Noell, renter
 Representative, Avon Products (1971); nurse, no employer listed (1977)
- 1981 Arthur W. Brown, renter
 No occupation listed

1985-86 No return

1992 Katherine McCarty, renter
No occupation listed

Background Research

Isabel Moreno Sifuentez was born in 1919 in Edna, Texas, a small community between Houston and Corpus Christi. In 1940, he was working at the Driskill Hotel, likely as a waiter, and living with his in-laws at a rental house at 421 E. 3rd Street. The Sifuentez family moved often, living at 504 E. 5th Street in 1941 and 304 (or 1304) E. 6th Street by 1947. By 1945, when Isabel enlisted in the Army, he listed his occupation as a baker. He was released in 1946. While the Sifuentezes were living on Charlotte Street, Isabel worked various jobs at Austin Baking, including helper, baker, and machine operator. He died in 1990 in Austin.

Janie (or Juanita or Juana) Mendoza Sifuentez (nee Soliz) was born in 1919 in Bastrop County. She married Isabel Sifuentez prior to 1935 and had at least two children. She died in 1994 in Austin.

LATIN OR colored — 3 bedrooms, close in. 1002 Charlotte. Located off West 10th Street. \$45 a month. GR 8-1313; after 6 HI 4-2890.

Clarksville's identity as a community of color was clear in this Austin American advertisement for renting 1002 Charlotte, 12/5/1965.

Building Permits

92

WATER SERVICE PERMIT
Austin, Texas

INDEXED No. 485

Received of FRANCIS C. BECKER Date 3-31-48

Address 1002 CHARLOTTE

Amount TWENTY AND 00/100 \$ 20.00

Plumber SELF Size of Tap 3/4"

Date of Connection 4-27-48

Size of Tap Made 3/4"

Size Service Made 3/4"

Size Main Tapped 6"

From Front Prop. Line to Curb Cock 7.5'

From W Prop. Line to Curb Cock 17'

Location of Meter CURB

Type of Box LOCK

Depth of Main in St. 3'

Depth of Service Line 2'

From Curb Cock to Tap on Main 13'

Checked by Engr. Dept. 5/21/48-528

No. Fittings	Size	
1	5/8"	Curb Cock
1	3/4"	Elbow
1	3/4"	St. Elbow
1	3/4"	Braking
1	3/4"	Reducer
1	3/4"	Pipe
		Lead Comp.
		Nipples
		Union
		Plug
1		Fee
1		Step
1		Box
1		Lid
		Valves
		Job No. <u>W 13225-502</u>
		Req. No. <u>J.P. 106</u>

Water service permit issued to Francis C. Becker, 3/31/1948.

No change due to connect **Application for Sewer Connection** No. 23993

Receipt No. *NW/II* Austin, Texas. *3-31-48*

To the Superintendent of Sanitary Sewer Division, City of Austin, Texas.

Sir:— I hereby make application for sewer connection and instructions on premises owned by *Francis C. Becker* at *1002 Charlotte* Street, further described as Lot *E 195* Block *14* Outlot *14* Division *92nd* subdivision *92nd* Plat *91* which is to be used as a *residence*

In this place there are to be installed *5* fixtures. Plumbing Permit No. *29134*

I agree to pay the City of Austin, the regular ordinance charge. *4-5-48*

Depth at Prop. Line *3'-4"* at *main* Respectfully, *Francis C. Becker*

St. Out Connected } *97'-N of NPL of W 100th* (Location)

Date: *5-17-48*

By: *Francis C. Becker*

NOTE: Connection Instruction *8" sewer in easement across lot*
Depth on record
angle 130' - N to W 170 S of MH A-2988 A 847

Sewer connection permit issued to Francis C. Becker, 3/31/1948.

Francie C. Becker, 1002 Charlotte St.
 (E) of 5 (50' x 125') - 14 -

91
94

Maas Addition

Box residence
 36518
 2-7-48 \$1500.00

Owner

Building permit for "box residence" worth \$1,500 issued to Francie [sic] C. Becker, 2/7/1948.

5-23-80 Repair Main STD

Isabella Sifuentas 1002 Charlotte St.

92' E. 14

Maas Addn.

Fr. Addn. to rear of Res.

02343 12-2-55 0700.00

Owner

Building permit for wood-frame rear addition worth \$700 issued to Isabella Sifuentas [sic], 12/2/1955.

OWNER	C.L. Sherrod	ADDRESS	1002 Charlotte St.
PLAT	92	LOT	Ctr. 56.311 of Orig 5
		BLK.	14
SUBDIVISION	Maas Addn		
OCCUPANCY	Repair & remodel		
BLDG. PERMIT #	199300	DATE	7-17-80
		OWNERS ESTIMATE	1,000.00
CONTRACTOR	Jim Person	NO. OF FIXTURES	
WATER TAP REC#		SEWER TAP REC#	
	Repair & remodel res to min standrs.		

Building permit for repair and remodel issued to C. L. Sherrod, 7/17/1980. Work was estimated to cost \$1,000.