

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
DECEMBER 17, 2018
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
C14H-2000-0012
Stanley Homestead and Out-Building
1809 and 1811 Newton Street

PROPOSAL

Construct three new structures at the rear of the site. There will be two new single family houses on the section of the property assigned the address of 1809 Newton Street (the west end of that address parcel contains the historic stone blacksmith shop), and one auxiliary dwelling unit on the section of the property assigned the address of 1811 Newton Street (the west end of the parcel contains the historic Stanley Homestead).

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The property has been subdivided in a condo regime and a privacy fence erected between the back of the historic house and outbuilding and the proposed new development site. The stone out-building was moved earlier this year in accordance with a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for the subdivision of the property and the construction of the new buildings on the rear portion of the lots that had previously been used as a parking area for the historic house.

The proposed new construction consists of two houses, each two stories tall, behind the stone outbuilding at 1809 Newton Street and a secondary apartment behind the historic house at 1811 Newton Street. The secondary apartment will have its access from West Mary Street on the south side of the property. The proposed secondary apartment is one-and-a-half stories tall and will be between 35 and 36 feet behind the historic house (the house is not parallel to the property line) with the fence in between the two structures. The principal entry to the secondary apartment will be on the south side of the building (facing Mary Street). The building will have horizontally-oriented cement board siding with a 6" exposure on the ground floor and vertically-oriented cement board paneling with a 24" exposure on the tympanum of the gable, with 1 x 2 battens covering the joints between the panels. The building will have either a metal or composition shingle roof. With a 12:12 slope similar to that on the historic house to the west.

At 1809 Newton Street (the address assigned to the stone out-building), the applicant proposes the construction of two single family houses, each two stories tall. The footprint of the house to the south will be larger than that of the house to the north, but both will have a similar appearance and roofline to the secondary apartment detailed above. The houses will both have horizontally-oriented siding on the ground floor and vertically-oriented siding on the second story with either a metal or shingled roof. The windows in the houses will be a combination of fixed sash, sliding, and sash configurations.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Commission's Standards for Review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness include:

- Do not destroy the distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Avoid the removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features.
- Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties are appropriate when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historic, architectural, or cultural material and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

- Construct new additions or alterations to structures in such a manner that if such addition or alteration were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure will be unimpaired.

In addition, The Secretary of the Interior's Technical Preservation Services Bulletin "Planning Successful Rehabilitation Projects" states:

New construction needs to be built in a manner that protects the integrity of the historic building and the property's setting. Related new construction, including buildings, driveways, parking lots, landscape improvements and other new features, must not alter the historic character of a property.

New construction should be placed away from or at the side or rear of historic buildings and must avoid obscuring, damaging, or destroying character-defining features of these buildings or the site.

The massing, size, scale, and architectural features of new construction on the site of a historic building must be compatible with those of the historic building. When visible and in close proximity to historic buildings, new construction must be subordinate. New construction should also be distinct from the old and must not attempt to replicate historic buildings elsewhere on site and to avoid creating a false sense of historic development.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee recommended reducing the scale and the location of the proposed new buildings in order to have as minimal a visual impact on the historic property and its context as possible. The applicant has re-designed the project to take the Committee's comments into consideration.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve as proposed. The proposed new buildings look to the historic house for their inspiration with their simple lines and roof forms. There is sufficient separation between the historic buildings and the new construction as to not adversely affect the context and character of the historic structures.



View across the front yard of the Stanley Homestead to the stone out-building.



View across the back of the Stanley Homestead showing the rear fence showing the division of the lots.



View from Mary Street across the proposed building site. The historic Stanley Homestead is to the left in this photograph.



View across the west fence of the proposed building site showing the historic Stanley Homestead to the left and the stone outbuilding to the right.



View from the middle of the rear lots towards the back of the Stanley Homestead (left) and the outbuilding (right)