

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
MAY 20, 2019
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
LHD-2018-0031
1404-10 W. 9TH STREET
SMOOT/TERRACE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

PROPOSAL

Rehabilitate and add to two contributing buildings; construct six multifamily buildings.

ARCHITECTURE

1408 W. 10th Street: irregular-plan wood-frame church building (converted house) with cross-gabled roof, Stick and Craftsman stylistic influences, and multi-lite casement wood-sash windows. Decorative elements include shingles in the gable end, brackets, a cross, and an entry hood on the west elevation.

1410 W. 10th Street: rectangular-plan house with combination gable and hipped roof, Craftsman stylistic influences, wood-sash windows, projecting porch, and brackets and decorative half-timbering in the gable.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The proposed work to 1408 W. 10th Street includes:

1. Repair existing wood-sash windows;
2. Replacement of a window with a second paneled door and addition of two bracketed entry hoods on the primary façade;
3. Replacement of the gable-end vent and window with a triangular window;
4. Replacement of the west elevation entrance with a 4:4 wood-sash window;
5. Addition of a gable-end window and two multi-lite casement wood-sash windows on the east elevation;
6. Addition of four 4:4 wood-sash windows with 1:4 transoms on the rear;
7. Construct a stone porch with wood railings on the secondary elevations;
8. Elevate the building approximately 3'; and
9. Construct a basement level with stone cladding, painted metal garage doors at the north/rear elevation, and casement wood-sash windows topped with bracketed hoods at the east and west elevations. Due to the site grading, the new level is largely below grade on the primary (south) façade. It will be accessed with stone steps.

The proposed work to 1410 W. 10th Street includes:

1. Relocation to the east to comply with multifamily compatibility requirements;
2. Repair existing wood-sash windows;
3. Remove the existing metal porch railings and construct a wraparound stone porch with wood railings on the primary façade and east elevation;
4. Alter a triple bank of south-facing windows into paired windows with a paneled door;
5. Replace a door on the east elevation with a 1:1 wood-sash window;
6. Elevate the building approximately 1'; and
7. Construct a basement level with stone cladding, painted metal garage doors at the north/rear elevation, and a fixed wood-sash window at the east elevation. Due to the site grading, this level is largely below grade on the primary (south) façade. It will be accessed with stone steps.

The new multifamily buildings are square- and rectangular-plan and 3 stories high, except for the northernmost building (2 stories). They are capped with gabled roofs with deep eaves, clad in reverse board-and-batten wood composite siding with stone accent walls, and feature bands of composite wood-sash windows with transoms and fully glazed sliding doors. The first floors contain garages with painted metal doors; second-story units have shallow balconies with wood railings. Site features include a 3' high wood fence fronting W. 9th Street at 1404 W. 9th Street and low stone walls throughout the property.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The property is contributing to the Smoot/Terrace Park Historic District. The following requirements from the district's design standards apply to the proposed alterations to the existing buildings:

- A.1 Retain and repair the historic exterior materials on front walls, side walls within 15 feet of the front, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that repair is not possible due to deterioration beyond repair.*

The proposed project retains and repairs historic exterior materials and front side walls of both 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street.

- B.1 Avoid alterations that enlarge doorways, relocate doorways, or add new door openings on front walls and side walls within 15 feet of the front.*

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the proposed project adds a second door and two bracketed entry hoods to the primary façade and removes a door from the front portion of the west wall. For 1410 W. 9th Street, the proposed project replaces a door on the front east (side) wall with a window. The project does not meet this standard.

- B.2 Retain and repair historic doors and door frames unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that deterioration is beyond repair.*

The door on the primary elevation will be retained.

- C.1 Avoid alterations that enlarge or relocate window openings, or add new window or skylight openings, on front walls, side walls within 15 feet of the front, or roofs within 15 feet of the front.*

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the proposed project adds a gable-end window and two windows on the front portion of the east wall. For 1410 W. 9th Street, the project removes one of a triple bank of windows on the primary façade and replaces it with a door. The project does not meet this standard.

- C.1 Retain and repair all components of existing historic windows, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that the individual component is deteriorated beyond repair.*

Existing windows will be retained.

- D.1 Retain and repair the historic front porch materials and features, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree they are deteriorated beyond repair.*

The front porch of 1410 W. 9th Street is proposed to be expanded to a wraparound wood porch. The project does not meet this standard.

- E.1 Retain and repair the original roof shape, including pitches, profiles, and eave heights and depths within 15 feet of the front.*

The project retains the original roof shape of both 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street.

- E.2 Retain and repair the historic dormers, historic gable/attic vents, historic roof*

brackets, and historic chimneys unless they are deteriorated beyond repair.

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the project replaces an attic window and vent with a larger attic window. The original roof features of 1410 W. 9th Street will be retained. The project partially complies with this standard.

The following requirements from the district's design standards apply to the proposed basement-level additions to the existing buildings:

1. *New additions should be compatible with the historic building by reflecting the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that they are not confused as historic or original to the building.*
2. *If designing an addition in a contemporary style, reflect the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building; if designing an addition in a style that reflects the style of the historic building, differentiate the scale, massing, and/or materials, at least slightly.*
The proposed additions are located directly underneath both buildings, mostly below grade from the street. They are differentiated with stone cladding and modern windows.
3. *Design new additions that are subordinate to and do not overpower the historic building.*
The additions are located beneath both buildings and minimally visible from W. 9th Street. They are subordinate to the historic buildings.
4. *Construct additions that avoid the removal or obstruction of any historic exterior features on the front of the building or the sides within 15 feet of the front.*
The additions do not require the removal or obstruction of any historic exterior features.
5. *Set back a new ground-level addition a minimum of 15 feet measured from the front wall of the house (excluding the porch).*
Not applicable.
6. *A new basement addition may extend to the front of the house.*
The additions extend to the front of the house.
7. *Design basement additions so that they do not raise the floor level of the house, or so that the new floor level of the house is not higher than either the average of the contributing houses on the same block face, or the average of the adjacent houses if contributing.*
The basement additions to 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street will raise the buildings 3' and 1', respectively. The new floor level of the house will not be higher than the average of the adjacent contributing houses on the same block face.
8. *Modern materials such as fiber-cement siding are appropriate for additions, provided that the overall design is compatible with the historic building.*
The additions are clad in stone.

The following requirements from the district's design standards apply to the proposed new construction on the property:

1. *New construction shall have the same street orientation and distance from adjacent buildings as the contributing buildings in the same block. New garages may have an alley-fronting orientation if in keeping with contributing garages in the district.*
The building at 1404 W. 9th Street is the only new construction facing W. 9th Street. It is set slightly farther apart than other contributing buildings, but has an alley entrance between it and 1408 W. 9th Street. All garages face the interior alley circulation.
2. *Setbacks for new construction of a new principal building shall be consistent with setbacks of the district's contributing houses by taking the average of the existing setbacks of contributing houses on the same block face, or by aligning with the setback of one adjacent contributing house. This may allow setbacks that are shallower than the base zoning.*
The setback of 1404 W. 9th Street is consistent with the setbacks of nearby contributing houses.
4. *Design new buildings so that they are compatible with, but differentiated from, historic buildings in the district.*
The new buildings are compatible with historic contributing buildings in the district, and particularly those on the property, through their gabled roofs, bands of vertical windows, and roof brackets. Their design and proportions reference the Stick and Craftsman influences of other contributing buildings. The new buildings are differentiated from contributing buildings through their simple massing, vertical siding, stone accent walls, and modern windows. The retention of the two contributing buildings and the rear lot placement of most of the new buildings minimizes the development's impact on the historic streetscape.
6. *For new residential buildings, garages shall be set back at least 15 feet from the front wall of the building (excluding the porch).*
The garage of 1404 W. 9th Street is set back 6' from the front wall of the building, but faces the side rather than the front. All other garages face alleys on the interior of the property.
7. *Protect large trees from damage during construction and from delayed damage due to construction activities.*
The applicant is working with the Community Tree Division to comply with this standard.

The proposed project somewhat meets the applicable standards.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The project came before the COA Review Committee multiple times. Recommendations from the most recent review on May 6, 2019: Pacing, patterns, and size of the new construction are compatible and differentiated. The committee strongly recommended relocating the transformer service pad to the rear of the site. The service pad has been relocated.




STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the new construction. Postpone a decision on the rehabilitation of 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street and the site features associated with the historic buildings; encourage the applicant to attend the June 10 Certificate of Appropriateness Review Committee meeting to discuss the rehabilitation plans in more detail. Staff appreciates the retention and thoughtful reuse

of both buildings, but believes that more detailed feedback will bring the proposed work into better compliance with the design standards.

LOCATION MAP



-  SUBJECT TRACT
-  PENDING CASE
-  ZONING BOUNDARY

1" = 333'

NOTIFICATIONS

CASE#: LHD-2018-0031

LOCATION: 1406 W 9TH ST

This product is for informational purposes and may not have been prepared for or be suitable for legal, engineering, or surveying purposes. It does not represent an on-the-ground survey and represents only the approximate relative location of property boundaries.

This product has been produced by CTM for the sole purpose of geographic reference. No warranty is made by the City of Austin regarding specific accuracy or completeness.



PROPERTY INFORMATION

Photos



Primary (south) façade of 1408 W. 9th Street.



West elevation and primary façade.



Primary (south) façade of 1410 W. 9th Street.



East elevation and primary façade.