

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
JUNE 24, 2019
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
LHD-2018-0031
1404-10 W. 9TH STREET
SMOOT/TERRACE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

PROPOSAL

Rehabilitate and add to two contributing buildings. New construction on the property was approved at the May 20, 2019 meeting.

ARCHITECTURE

1408 W. 10th Street: irregular-plan wood-frame church building (converted house) with cross-gabled roof, Stick and Craftsman stylistic influences, and multi-lite casement wood-sash windows. Decorative elements include shingles in the gable end, brackets, a cross, and an entry hood on the west elevation.

1410 W. 10th Street: rectangular-plan house with combination gable and hipped roof, Craftsman stylistic influences, wood-sash windows, projecting porch, and brackets and decorative half-timbering in the gable.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The proposed work to 1408 W. 10th Street includes:

1. Elevate the building approximately 3' from its current location and construct stone steps to the primary facade;
2. Replace all existing windows in-kind;
3. Replace the door on the primary facade in-kind;
4. Repair existing siding, replacing in-kind where necessary due to deterioration as noted on the conditions assessment;
5. Repair and retain existing brackets;
6. Replace a window with a second paneled door on the primary (south) facade to match the existing paneled door;
7. Add a new window on the primary facade to match existing windows;
8. Replace the gable-end vent and window on the primary facade with a triangular window;
9. Replace the west elevation entrance with a 4:4 wood-sash window;
10. Add a gable-end window and two multi-lite casement wood-sash windows to match existing on the east elevation;
11. Add wood-sash windows and transoms on the rear (north) elevation;
12. Construct a stone porch with wood railings on the secondary elevations; and
13. Construct a basement level with stone cladding, metal garage doors at the north/rear elevation, and casement wood-sash windows topped with bracketed hoods at the east and west elevations. Due to the site grading, the new level is largely below grade on the primary (south) facade.

The proposed work to 1410 W. 10th Street includes:

1. Relocate the building 25' to the east to comply with multifamily compatibility requirements;
2. Elevate the building approximately 1' from its current height above grade, adding stone steps to access the front porch;
3. Replace all existing windows in-kind;

4. Repair existing siding, replacing in-kind where necessary due to deterioration as noted on the conditions assessment;
5. Replace the existing metal front door with a paneled, partially glazed wood door;
6. Replace existing door sidelights in-kind;
7. Repair and retain existing brackets;
8. Replace the existing metal porch railings and porch columns with Craftsman-era style elements similar to surrounding contributing buildings;
9. Construct a wraparound stone porch with wood railings on the primary façade and east elevation;
10. On the south elevation, replace a window (set back from the primary façade) with a partially glazed door;
11. On the east elevation, add paired windows in the gable end, infill a rear window opening, and replace a door in-kind;
12. On the rear (north) elevation, add a window to match existing and infill a door and two window openings with matching siding; and
13. Construct a basement level with stone cladding, painted metal garage doors at the north/rear elevation, and a fixed wood-sash window at the east elevation. Due to the site grading, this level is largely below grade on the primary (south) façade. It will be accessed with stone steps.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The property is contributing to the Smoot/Terrace Park Historic District. The following requirements from the district's design standards apply to the proposed alterations to the existing buildings:

A.1 Retain and repair the historic exterior materials on front walls and side walls within 15 feet of the front, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that repair is not possible due to deterioration beyond repair.

The project retains and repairs historic siding on 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street. The applicant is proposing to replace all windows in-kind and has submitted conditions assessments showing deterioration.

B.1 Avoid alterations that enlarge doorways, relocate doorways, or add new door openings on front walls and side walls within 15 feet of the front.

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the project adds a second door to the primary façade and removes a door from the front portion of the west wall. The project somewhat meets this standard.

B.2 Retain and repair historic doors and door frames unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that deterioration is beyond repair.

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the project replaces the existing door on the primary elevation in-kind, due to deterioration. For 1410 W. 9th Street, the project replaces the existing metal door with a wood door. The project meets this standard.

C.1 Avoid alterations that enlarge or relocate window openings, or add new window or skylight openings, on front walls, side walls within 15 feet of the front, or roofs within 15 feet of the front.

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the project adds a gable-end window and two windows on the front portion of the east wall. The project does not meet this standard.

C.1 Retain and repair all components of existing historic windows, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that the individual component is deteriorated beyond repair.

All existing windows will be replaced in-kind. The applicant has submitted a conditions assessment showing deterioration.

- D.1 Retain and repair the historic front porch materials and features, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree they are deteriorated beyond repair.*

Existing non-historic porch elements of 1410 W. 9th Street are proposed to be replaced with elements more in keeping with the Craftsman style.

- E.1 Retain and repair the original roof shape, including pitches, profiles, and eave heights and depths within 15 feet of the front.*

The project retains the original roof shape of both 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street.

- E.2 Retain and repair the historic dormers, historic gable/attic vents, historic roof brackets, and historic chimneys unless they are deteriorated beyond repair.*

For 1408 W. 9th Street, the project replaces an attic window and vent with a larger attic window. The original roof features of 1410 W. 9th Street will be retained. The project partially complies with this standard.

The following requirements from the district's design standards apply to the proposed basement-level additions to the existing buildings:

- 1. New additions should be compatible with the historic building by reflecting the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that they are not confused as historic or original to the building.*

- 2. If designing an addition in a contemporary style, reflect the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building; if designing an addition in a style that reflects the style of the historic building, differentiate the scale, massing, and/or materials, at least slightly.*

The additions are located directly underneath both buildings, mostly below grade from the street. They are differentiated with stone cladding and modern windows.

- 3. Design new additions that are subordinate to and do not overpower the historic building.*

The additions are located beneath both buildings and minimally visible from W. 9th Street. They are subordinate to the historic buildings.

- 4. Construct additions that avoid the removal or obstruction of any historic exterior features on the front of the building or the sides within 15 feet of the front.*

The additions do not require the removal or obstruction of any historic exterior features.

- 5. Set back a new ground-level addition a minimum of 15 feet measured from the front wall of the house (excluding the porch).*

Not applicable.

- 6. A new basement addition may extend to the front of the house.*

The additions extend to the front of the house.

- 7. Design basement additions so that they do not raise the floor level of the house, or so that the new floor level of the house is not higher than either the average of the contributing houses on the same block face, or the average of the adjacent houses if contributing.*

The basement additions to 1408 and 1410 W. 9th Street will raise the buildings 3' and

1', respectively. The new floor level of the house will not be higher than the average of the adjacent contributing houses on the same block face.

8. *Modern materials such as fiber-cement siding are appropriate for additions, provided that the overall design is compatible with the historic building.*
The additions are clad in stone.

The proposed project largely meets the applicable standards.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The project came before the committee multiple times. Recommendations from the most recent review on June 10, 2019:

- Evaluate condition of windows and siding, and replace historic-age material only where necessary;
- If windows must be replaced on the front walls, relocate windows from the sides and rear where size permits;
- Remove the proposed door hoods from the front of 1408 W. 9th Street;
- Add entry stairs to the front of 1410 W. 9th Street;
- Retain the entrance on the east wall of 1410 W. 9th Street;
- Change the proposed door on the south wall of 1410 W. 9th Street to a pattern more in keeping with the band of windows; and
- Select posts and railings for the front porch of 1410 W. 9th Street that are similar to posts and railings of compatible contributing buildings in the district.




The committee was supportive of adding a second entrance to the front of 1408 W. 9th Street, recognizing that is an unusual situation.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the project.

LOCATION MAP



-  SUBJECT TRACT
-  PENDING CASE
-  ZONING BOUNDARY

1" = 333'

NOTIFICATIONS

CASE#: LHD-2018-0031

LOCATION: 1406 W 9TH ST



This product is for informational purposes and may not have been prepared for or be suitable for legal, engineering, or surveying purposes. It does not represent an on-the-ground survey and represents only the approximate relative location of property boundaries.

This product has been produced by CTM for the sole purpose of geographic reference. No warranty is made by the City of Austin regarding specific accuracy or completeness.

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Photos



Primary (south) façade of 1408 W. 9th Street.



West elevation and primary façade.



Primary (south) façade of 1410 W. 9th Street.



East elevation and primary façade.