

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
JULY 22, 2019
LHD-2019-0021
610 BAYLOR STREET
CASTLE HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

PROPOSAL

Restore historic house; add dormers, a skylight, modify the rear of the house, and add a new rear deck.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The applicant proposes the restoration of the historic Ball-Perry House, which is contributing to the Castle Hill Historic District. The proposed project will reconstruct missing architectural features, including dormers, chimneys, and balconies, as well as restore the brick to a red brick appearance. The changes to the house include the construction of a 3rd floor deck and handrail on the back of the house, modifying the roofline at the new back porch to accommodate a new elevator, replacing a non-original dormer at the rear of the north elevation with a new dormer, reconstructing a missing window at the entry stair on the north elevation, changing the rear window on the south side to a door to access the second-floor front porch area; the door will be designed to resemble the window it replaces; removing a non-original dormer from the back of the house, and installing a new pyramid-shaped skylight at the top of the roof. The skylight will not be visible from the public view of the structure. The rear section of the house will be modified with the construction of two shed dormers on the sides. Round dormer windows will be rehabilitated and new finials will be installed to match historic features and appearance. The roof will be removed and replaced with a metal roof with a dark finish.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are used to evaluate projects on historic landmarks. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

- 1) *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

Evaluation: The project is part of a larger proposal to restore the house as a single-family dwelling, its historic use.

- 2) *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

Evaluation: Only non-original historic features are being removed as a course of this project, which will restore the house to its original appearance.

- 3) *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

Evaluation: The project seeks to restore the original appearance of the house.

- 4) *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

Evaluation: The project is returning the house to its original appearance; non-original features are being removed.

- 5) *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

Evaluation: The house is a restoration project that will preserve original architectural features.

- 6) *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Evaluation: The proposed project will repair deteriorated historic features.

- 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Evaluation: The changes proposed by this project are on the rear of the house and do not affect the visual integrity of the property from the public viewsheds. The proposed changes are differentiated from the historic features of the house.

- 10) *New additions and adjacent or related construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Evaluation The proposed changes are on the rear of the house and will not affect the integrity of the historic house.

The Castle Hill Historic District Design Standards applicable to this project state:

1. Repair, rather than replace, original materials. Replace only materials that are deteriorated beyond repair or that detract from and are not original to the building. Replacement materials shall match the original materials when feasible.
2. Do not make changes to the public view of an existing contributing or non-contributing building that have no historic basis and/or that seek to create the appearance of an architectural style that is not original to the existing building.
3. Use best efforts to utilize photographic or physical evidence when reconstructing original historic details.
4. Maintain the historic style and retain character-defining features. Character-defining features generally include exterior wall materials, windows and window screens, doors and entryway details, roof form, porches, chimneys, railings, and trim.
5. Do not install new materials that obscure or endanger original materials, including but not limited to painting original masonry or installation of vinyl or aluminum siding over original wood siding.
6. Repair existing original windows unless determined infeasible due to excessive deterioration that is adequately documented in the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.
7. Replacement windows, where permitted, must match the original, size, profile, muntin shape, configuration, and details. Do not use vinyl-clad windows. Do not use false muntins attached to or inserted between insulated glass panels.

8. When replacing a roof, maintain the original roof form and other character-defining features of the roof including overhangs, barge boards, rafter tails, and cresting where existing.
9. Unacceptable roof materials are those that are not used elsewhere in the district, are not appropriate to the subject property, or have otherwise been determined incompatible with the district or the subject property.
10. When repointing existing masonry, new mortar shall match the original mortar in color, composition, texture, and tooling.
11. Acceptable roof materials include but are not limited to composition shingle, metal roofs of all types except corrugated metal, fiberglass shingles, metal shingles, as determined appropriate.
12. For contributing buildings, a new addition shall not visually overpower the existing building, compromise its historic character, or destroy any unique character-defining features.

The project meets all the applicable standards.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

Approve as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve as proposed.