

Joint Committee on AWU's Financial Plan

Rate Design Evaluation Matrix

*** DRAFT ***

Option #	Description	Overall Ranking		Volatility Ranking \$ Volatility Measure		Affordability Ranking Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. Customer Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. CAP Customer					Strengthening Conservation Ranking Fixed Fee Block 1 to 5 Ratio, Volumetric Blocks 1 to 5 Ratio, Percent Bill Change for 7,727 gals. customer, Percent Bill Change for 30,000 gal. customer										
		Overall Ranking	Sum of All Rankings	Volatility Ranking	Volatility Measure	Affordability Ranking	Sum of Affordability Rankings	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Percentage	Conservation Ranking	Sum of Conservation Rankings	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Ratio	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Ratio	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Percentage
26	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$2.63, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$8.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue, \$0.22 per 1,000 gallon volumetric revenue stability fee from all classes to fund reserve fund,	1	14	10	\$2.73	1	2	1	-11.9%	1	-18.0%	3	36	13	8	1	12.25	15	2.2%	7	5.4%
20	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	2	16	9	\$2.94	2	4	2	-11.7%	2	-17.4%	5	50.5	13	8	9.5	10.36	9	8.0%	19	-2.0%
27	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.50, block 2 at \$2.50, block 3 at \$4.40, and blocks 4-5 at \$10.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue, \$0.22 per 1,000 gallon volumetric revenue stability fee from all classes to fund reserve fund,	3.5	23	8	\$3.14	3	6	3	-10.3%	3	-13.6%	12	61	16	6.67	17	9.8	22	-0.5%	6	6.2%
23	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$2.63, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$8.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue, block rates set higher to recover additional \$3.6 million from higher blocks to fund residential contribution to the reserve fund	3.5	23	12	\$2.09	10	22.5	17	-5.4%	5.5	-5.0%	1	31	13	8	2.5	12	7	10.8%	8.5	5.3%
3	New tiered fixed fee \$1.00 to \$20.75, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates	5	23.5	11	\$2.42	8.5	19.5	6.5	-8.7%	13	0.0%	4	45.5	1	20.75	9.5	10.42	30	-4.2%	5	6.5%
28	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.50, block 2 at \$2.50, block 3 at \$4.00, blocks 4 at \$10.00, and block 5 at \$12.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 10% total revenue, \$0.11 per 1,000 gallon volumetric revenue stability fee from all classes to fund reserve fund,	6	29	7	\$3.63	7	19	11	-6.2%	8	-0.7%	15	64.5	13	8	19.5	9.2	14	3.9%	18	-0.5%
15	New tiered fixed fee \$1.00 to \$10.25, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates	7	30.5	13	\$2.03	8.5	19.5	6.5	-8.7%	13	0.0%	9	52.5	9	10.25	9.5	10.42	21	-0.1%	13	2.3%

Joint Committee on AWU's Financial Plan

Rate Design Evaluation Matrix

*** DRAFT ***

Option #	Description	Overall Ranking		Volatility Ranking \$ Volatility Measure		Affordability Ranking Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. Customer Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. CAP Customer					Strengthening Conservation Ranking Fixed Fee Block 1 to 5 Ratio, Volumetric Blocks 1 to 5 Ratio, Percent Bill Change for 7,727 gals. customer, Percent Bill Change for 30,000 gal. customer										
		Overall Ranking	Sum of All Rankings	Volatility Ranking	Volatility Measure	Affordability Ranking	Sum of Affordability Rankings	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Percentage	Conservation Ranking	Sum of Conservation Rankings	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Ratio	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Ratio	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Percentage
19	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	9.5	35	15	\$2.01	13	27	14	-6.1%	13	0.0%	7	51	4.5	12.5	9.5	10.42	26	-2.0%	11	3.2%
18	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	9.5	35	15	\$2.01	13	27	14	-6.1%	13	0.0%	7	51	4.5	12.5	9.5	10.42	26	-2.0%	11	3.2%
16	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates	9.5	35	15	\$2.01	13	27	14	-6.1%	13	0.0%	7	51	4.5	12.5	9.5	10.42	26	-2.0%	11	3.2%
25	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, volumetric rates for blocks 3-5 increased to recover additional \$3.3 million for residential contribution to the creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	9.5	35	20	\$0.83	13	27	14	-6.1%	13	0.0%	2	33.5	4.5	12.5	4	10.9	23	-1.1%	2	9.4%
12	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$20.00, 30% fixed revenue goal, volumetric rates reduced to offset increased fixed revenue	12	40	1	\$9.22	25	47	27	7.5%	20	4.9%	14	63	10	8.333	22	8.333	4	14.1%	27	-16.2%
24	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, block rates reduced to 4 blocks instead of 5, blocks at 0-2k, 2-8k, 8-20k, and 20k+, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue, block rates set higher to recover additional \$4.9 million from higher blocks to fund residential contribution to the reserve fund	13	45	30	(\$8.15)	5	13.5	8	-8.6%	5.5	-5.0%	10	58	4.5	12.5	2.5	12	28	-2.7%	23	-13.5%
2	New tiered fixed fee \$1.00 to \$5.78, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates	14	45.5	17	\$1.31	17.5	33.5	20.5	0.0%	13	0.0%	11	59.5	19	5.78	9.5	10.42	16	1.0%	15	0.5%
11	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$14.00, 25% fixed revenue goal, volumetric rates reduced to offset increased fixed revenue	15	49	4	\$5.69	24	46	25	2.9%	21	5.8%	21	69.5	18	5.833	19.5	9.2	10	7.8%	22	-6.5%

Joint Committee on AWU's Financial Plan

Rate Design Evaluation Matrix

*** DRAFT ***

Option #	Description	Overall Ranking		Volatility Ranking \$ Volatility Measure		Affordability Ranking Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. Customer Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. CAP Customer					Strengthening Conservation Ranking Fixed Fee Block 1 to 5 Ratio, Volumetric Blocks 1 to 5 Ratio, Percent Bill Change for 7,727 gals. customer, Percent Bill Change for 30,000 gal. customer										
		Overall Ranking	Sum of All Rankings	Volatility Ranking	Volatility Measure	Affordability Ranking	Sum of Affordability Rankings	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Percentage	Conservation Ranking	Sum of Conservation Rankings	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Ratio	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Ratio	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Percentage
29	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$2.65, block 3 at \$4.00, and blocks 4 at \$10.00, and block 5 at \$12.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, reduces spread between blocks 1 and 5, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 10% total revenue, \$0.11 per 1,000 gallon volumetric revenue stability fee from all classes to fund reserve fund.	16	49	5	\$5.08	28	52.5	28	8.5%	24.5	27.4%	16	65	8	12	27.5	3.4	5	13.4%	24.5	-14.0%
1	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$5.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, no change to volumetric rates	17.5	51	18	\$1.24	16	32	19	-0.8%	13	0.0%	17	66	21.5	2.292	9.5	10.42	19	0.4%	16	0.4%
7	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$5.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, residential rate blocks change from 2-9K to 2-5K	17.5	51	23	(\$0.74)	6	17	10	-6.2%	7	-2.1%	22	70	21.5	2.292	21	8.547	3	15.1%	24.5	-14.0%
22	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$3.00, block 3 at \$6.80, and blocks 4 at \$12.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, rate blocks reduced to 4, blocks at 0-2k, 2-8k, 8-20k, and 20k+, reduced spread between blocks 1 and 5, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	19	51.5	24	(\$1.37)	4	8	4	-9.7%	4	-7.3%	23.5	72.5	4.5	12.5	18	9.398	24	-1.6%	26	-14.7%
21	New tiered fixed fee block 1 at \$1.00, block 2 at \$2.63, block 3 at \$6.00, and blocks 4-5 at \$8.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, new block intervals based on Karen Keese general recommendations, blocks at 0-2k, 2-6k, 6-11k, 11-20k, and 20k+, reduces spread between blocks 1 and 5, creation of revenue stability reserve fund at 20% total revenue	20	58	6	\$4.76	26	50.5	26	6.1%	24.5	27.4%	26	74.5	13	8	27.5	3.4	6	12.3%	28	-16.9%
5	New tiered fixed fee \$1.00 to \$6.00, 20% fixed revenue goal, volumetric rates at cost of service of \$4.36 for all blocks	21	58.5	2	\$7.61	29.5	59	30	45.0%	29	88.3%	27	76	17	6	29	1	1	37.6%	29	-43.2%
10	No revenue stability fee implemented in 2012, minimum charge and volume rates increased to recover fee revenue	22	59	27	(\$3.14)	13	27	5	-8.8%	22	10.5%	19	69	27.5	0	9.5	10.35	29	-2.9%	3	8.7%
9	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$5.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, residential rate blocks change from 2-9K to 2-8K	23	60	19	\$1.14	22	41.5	23	1.1%	18.5	4.4%	19	69	21.5	2.292	15.5	10.26	12	5.5%	20	-4.2%
8	New tiered fixed fee \$2.40 to \$5.50, 20% fixed revenue goal, residential rate blocks change from 2-9K to 2-7K	24	61	21	\$0.71	21	40.5	22	0.5%	18.5	4.4%	19	69	21.5	2.292	15.5	10.26	11	7.6%	21	-5.1%
4	New tiered fixed fee \$4.20 to \$4.40, 20% fixed revenue goal, volumetric rates at \$4.38 for all blocks	25	62.5	3	\$7.31	29.5	59	29	44.3%	30	89.1%	30	86	24	1.048	30	1	2	36.3%	30	-43.6%

Joint Committee on AWU's Financial Plan

Rate Design Evaluation Matrix

***** DRAFT *****

Option #	Description	Overall Ranking		Volatility Ranking \$ Volatility Measure		Affordability Ranking Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. Customer Bill Change for 5,000 Gal. CAP Customer					Strengthening Conservation Ranking Fixed Fee Block 1 to 5 Ratio, Volumetric Blocks 1 to 5 Ratio, Percent Bill Change for 7,727 gals. customer, Percent Bill Change for 30,000 gal. customer										
		Overall Ranking	Sum of All Rankings	Volatility Ranking	Volatility Measure	Affordability Ranking	Sum of Affordability Rankings	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 5,000 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for CAP 5,000 Gals Percentage	Conservation Ranking	Sum of Conservation Rankings	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Fixed Fee: Top/Bottom Ratio	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Rank	Residential Volumetric Tiers: Top/Bottom Ratio	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 7,727 Gals Percentage	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Rank	Bill Change for 30,000 Gals Percentage
Base Option	2012 Approved rates	26	64.5	22	\$0.00	17.5	33.5	20.5	0.0%	13	0.0%	25	74	27.5	0	9.5	10.42	20	0.0%	17	0.0%
14	No tiered fixed fee, reduced fixed revenue to 10.2%, volumetric rates increased consistently across blocks, 50% of block 5 revenue transferred to revenue stability reserve fund, \$5.5M for reserve from residential only	27	69	29	(\$4.13)	27	52	24	1.7%	28	41.5%	13	61.5	27.5	0	25	6.183	8	9.1%	1	9.6%
13	No tiered fixed fee, reduced minimum charge to \$5.60 (5/8"), reduced fixed revenue to 9.1%, volumetric rates increased consistently across blocks	28	70.5	28	(\$3.62)	19	35	9	-8.2%	26	34.5%	23.5	72.5	27.5	0	24	6.589	17	0.8%	4	7.1%
6	No tiered fixed fee, reduced fixed revenue, volumetric rates increased consistently across blocks	29	74	26	(\$3.01)	20	37	14	-6.1%	23	25.9%	28	77	27.5	0	23	7.22	18	0.7%	8.5	5.3%
17	No tiered fixed fee, reduced fixed revenue to 10.5%, volumetric rates for blocks 1 & 2 increased consistently to recover revenue	30	77	25	(\$2.42)	23	45	18	-1.4%	27	35.2%	29	80.5	27.5	0	26	6.157	13	4.9%	14	1.2%