



City of Austin  
**Neighborhood Planning and Zoning Department**  
Alice Glasco, Director  
P.O. Box 1088, Austin, Texas 78767  
512-974-7668

## **Memorandum**

February 17, 2005

To: Mayor and Council

From : Steve Sadowsky, Historic Preservation Officer

Re: Brown-Ledel-Silverman House  
609 West Lynn Street  
C14H-04-0027

### **CASE HISTORY:**

- Staff evaluated and recommended historic zoning for this property to the Historic Landmark Commission upon application for a demolition permit in October, 2003.
- The Historic Landmark Commission initiated a historic zoning case on this property in October, 2003 with the support of the record owner of the property at the time, but took no further action when the demolition permit application was withdrawn.
- The owners were involved in legal disputes regarding the property, and then subject to a series of family illnesses which prevented them from pro-actively filing an application for historic zoning.
- Following resolution of the family legal disputes, the owner of 609 West Lynn Street (Dolph Dildy) filed an application for a demolition permit in November, 2004 in order to sell the property to Hunter Goodwin, the current owner.
- Staff visited the site with Goodwin, his agent, and structural engineer Jerry Garcia on October 20, 2004 and visually inspected the site, noting deterioration.
- Staff received Jerry Garcia's report detailing the deterioration of the house and reluctantly recommended approval of the demolition permit to the Historic Landmark Commission at their November 15, 2004 meeting. The Historic Landmark Commission recommended historic zoning for the property.
- The Old West Austin Neighborhood Association commissioned structural engineer John Raff of Jaster Quintanilla to provide a second opinion regarding the

structural problems and deterioration of the structure. Jaster Quintanilla's report contained a cost estimate to repair the structural deterioration, while Jerry Garcia's initial report did not. Jaster Quintanilla estimated that the structural problems identified by both structural engineers could be remedied for \$41,025, and estimated that the plumbing, electrical, site, and roof problems could be addressed for an additional \$60,000, for a total structural rehabilitation cost of approximately \$100,000.

- The case proceeded to the Planning Commission on January 11, 2005. Based upon the new information from Jaster Quintanilla regarding the cost to rehabilitate the house, staff reversed the recommendation to approve demolition in favor of a recommendation for historic zoning, with the caveat that staff recognized the deteriorated state of the property. The Planning Commission postponed action until January 25, 2005, when they voted to forward the case to Council without a recommendation due to lack of a quorum.

- Council held the public hearing on this case on February 10, 2005, and heard conflicting reports as to the cost to rehabilitate the structure from the owner's structural engineer and the neighborhood association. John Raff, the structural engineer hired by the neighborhood association, could not stay until such time as Council heard the case. Council closed the public hearing and postponed action on the case until February 17, 2005, requesting that staff meet with both structural engineers to determine the justification for the diverging cost estimates for rehabilitation. Council further requested that staff evaluate the house for its context within a potential National Register or local historic district in the area.

- Staff met with Jerry Garcia, John Raff, and contractor Danny Dishman at the offices of Jaster Quintanilla on February 14, 2005. Dishman presented a detailed cost estimate to rehabilitate the house, totaling \$872,000. Raff identified the structural work his report addressed for \$100,000. Dishman's estimate for the same work was \$144,700.

- Staff went through each item of Dishman's cost estimate with the engineers and identified those costs which were necessary specifically for the rehabilitation of this house versus those costs for professional fees, permit fees, interim insurance, and those costs dependent on the owner's aesthetics, determining that the structural, mechanical, and site rehabilitation of this property would involve approximately \$467,900, including a 25% contractor's profit of \$93,000. The engineers agreed that this cost appeared reasonable for the work required.

- Staff reviewed the market value appraisals of this property, other residential properties on West Lynn Street between West 6th and West 9th Streets, and other comparable properties in the neighborhood. The results are attached.

**EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE  
WITHIN A POTENTIAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT**

The ca. 1893 Brown-Ledel-Silverman House would certainly be contributing to a potential West End historic district. Built before the area was platted, the Brown-Ledel-Silverman House represents the first phase of residential building in the neighborhood, characterized by large houses on large lots. This house, the house to the north, and the landmarked Sheeks-Robertson House directly to the west, are all located on relatively-large divisions of an early outlot. The remainder of the area was platted and subdivided into smaller bungalow-sized lots in the 1910s and 1920s. The majority of the houses in the neighborhood are modest wood-frame bungalows, with a high degree of architectural integrity.

The proposed Old West Line National Register Historic District encompasses the area roughly between Baylor Street on the east, Sixth Street on the south, Mo-Pac on the west, and Twelfth Street on the north. The proposed historic district contains a total of 985 buildings, sites, structures, and object, of which 639 (64.8%) are contributing to the historic character of the district. The Brown-Ledel-Silverman House at 609 West Lynn Street is listed as contributing to the proposed historic district as well as a property which is individually eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

If you have any questions concerning this information or need further information, please telephone Steve Sadowsky, Historic Preservation Officer, at 974-6454.

cc: Toby Hamett Futrell, City Manager

## ATTACHMENT "A"

Contractor's estimate for rehabilitation of 609 West Lynn - February 14, 2005.

609 West Lynn

| CONTRACTOR | REF | DESCRIPTION                    | RELIM. EST. | REMARKS          | COST<br>CHANGE | REMARKS               |
|------------|-----|--------------------------------|-------------|------------------|----------------|-----------------------|
|            | 700 | LOT COSTS                      |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 701 | LOT CC                         |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 702 | ENGINEER                       | 3,500.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | GEOTECHNICAL ENGINEERING       |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 703 | PLANS                          | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 704 | APPRAISAL                      | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 705 | PERMITS                        | 900.00      |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | ICRA                           |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 706 | TAP FEES                       | 6,000.00    |                  | 0.00           | water, gas, sewer     |
|            |     | GAS                            | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | ELECTRIC                       |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | WATER & SEWER                  |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 707 | SITE WORK                      | 8,000.00    |                  | 0.00           | ALLOWANCE             |
|            |     | drainage plan and french drain | 12,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | site prep-fill                 | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           | ALLOWANCE             |
|            | 708 | SURVEY                         |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 709 | foundation repair              | 8,700.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | pier & beam repair             | 80,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | WATERPROOFING                  | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | FRENCH DRAIN                   | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           | ALLOWANCE             |
|            |     | RETAINING WALLS                | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | TERMITE TREAT                  | 1,500.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | mold treatment                 | 6,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | demo & removal of addition     | 10,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | PVC IN SLAB                    | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 710 | FLATWORK                       |             |                  | 0.00           | ALLOWANCE             |
|            |     | STEPS                          |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | WALKS                          |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 711 | LUMBER                         | 28,000.00   |                  | 0.00           | reframe structure     |
|            |     | KOOLPLY                        | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | TYVEK                          | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | DECORATIVE BEAMS               |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | BEAMS                          |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | STEEL LINTELS                  | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 712 | FRAMING                        | 29,000.00   |                  | 0.00           | reframe new structure |
|            |     | remove damaged siding          | 9,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | remove damaged lumber of       | 12,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | rebuild roof deck              | 8,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     |                                |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 713 | remove & repair windows        | 16,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | WINDOWS-WOOD                   |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 714 | EXTERIOR DOORS                 | 3,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | FRONT DOOR                     |             |                  | 0.00           | ALLOWANCE             |
|            |     | EXT SHUTTERS                   |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 715 | FIREPLACE                      | 10,000.00   |                  | 0.00           | repair fireplace      |
|            | 716 | MASONRY MATERIAL               |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | MASONRY LABOR                  |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | INCREASE FOR 100% MASONRY      |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | MAIL BOX                       | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | CASTSTONE                      |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | STUCCO                         |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | CUT STONE                      |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | COLUMNS                        |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | COLUMN INSTALLATION            |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | INTERIOR MASONRY               |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | FLAGSTONE                      |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | DROPPED MASONRY LEDGE          |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 717 | ROOFING                        | 16,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | remove old roof                | 3,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | TORCH DOWN                     |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | VENTS & FLASHING               | 2,600.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 718 | INSULATION                     | 8,200.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 719 | SHEET ROCK                     | 16,000.00   |                  | 0.00           | repair and refinish   |
|            | 720 | PLUMBING                       | 18,000.00   | new plumb & serv | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | remove old plumbing & servi    | 8,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | replace and refinish bath fbc  | 9,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 721 | ELECTRIC                       | 21,000.00   | new wire & serv  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | removal of old wire & elec at  | 4,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | ADD FOR ALL ELECTRIC           |             |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | DIMMERS                        | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            |     | FAN CONTROLS                   | 0.00        |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 722 | HEAT & A/C                     | 12,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 723 | PAINTING                       | 18,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 724 | TRIM MATERIAL                  | 18,000.00   |                  | 0.00           | repair and refinish   |
|            |     | stair rail repair/replace      | 9,000.00    |                  | 0.00           |                       |
|            | 725 | TRIM LABOR                     | 13,000.00   |                  | 0.00           |                       |

|                        |            |         |                          |
|------------------------|------------|---------|--------------------------|
| 726 INTERIOR DOORS     |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 727 GARAGE DOOR        |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 728 CABINETS           | 25,000.00  |         | 0.00                     |
| CABINET INSTALL        |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 729 APPLIANCES         | 12,000.00  |         | 0.00                     |
| HANG STOVE HOOD        |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 730 MARBLE TUB         |            |         | 0.00                     |
| MARBLE                 |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 731 tile floors & tops | 14,000.00  |         | 0.00                     |
| 732 CARPET & VINYL     | 7,000.00   |         | 0.00 ALLOWANCE           |
| 733 LAMINATE           |            |         | 0.00                     |
| GRANITE                |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 734 WALLPAPER          | 8,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 734 WALLPAPER LAB      |            | see 734 | 0.00 ALLOWANCE           |
| 736 MIRRORS            | 2,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 737 FANS               | SEE 736    |         | 0.00                     |
| 738 LIGHTS             | 14,000.00  |         | 0.00 ALLOWANCE           |
| 739 HARDWARE           | 8,000.00   |         | 0.00 replace and refin   |
| CAB PULLS              | 0.00       |         | 0.00 ALLOWANCE           |
| 740 SHELVING           | SEE 724    |         | 0.00                     |
| 741 trash/clean        | 8,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| ROUGH GRADE            | 1,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 742 FINAL GRADE        | 4,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 743 LANDSCAPING        | 12,000.00  |         | 0.00 ALLOWANCE           |
| 744 dumpster           | 6,100.00   |         | 0.00 dumpster fees       |
| 745 FENCE              |            |         | 0.00                     |
| SILT FENCE             | 3,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| IRON RAIL              |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 746 UNDERPINNING       | 800.00     |         | 0.00                     |
| 747 SEPTIC SYSTEM      | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| SEPTIC ENGINEER        | 1,250.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 748 WATER WELL         | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 749 INTERIOR DESIGN    | 3,500.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 750 C UPGRADES         | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 751 INSPECTIONS        | 2,400.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 752 WARR FEE           | 2,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 753 UTILITIES          | 1,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 754 BLDG RISK          | 5,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 755 BANK CHARGES       | 600.00     |         | 0.00                     |
| 756 INTERIM INTEREST   | 80,000.00  |         | 0.00                     |
| 757 PUNCH              | 3,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 758 PROJECT MGT.       |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 759 OVERHEAD           |            |         | 0.00                     |
| 760 REALTOR            | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 761 10 YR WARRANTY     | 2,000.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 762 DISCOUNT PTS       | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 763 MARKETING          | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 764 PLAN PRINTING      | 650.00     |         | 0.00                     |
| 765 SEC SYSTEM         | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 766 INTERCOM           | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| CENTRAL VAC            | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| fire system            | 2,500.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| SPEAKER WIRE           | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 767 FL TRUSSES         | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 768 GUTTERS            | 2,100.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 769 GARAGE OPENER      | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 770 CITY SIDEWALKS     | 2,200.00   |         | 0.00 city & entry walk   |
| 771 LAWN SPRINKLER     | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 772 REIM BUYER         | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 773 DEBRIS CLEAN       | 700.00     |         | 0.00                     |
| 774 PORT TOILET        | 1,500.00   |         | 0.00                     |
| 775 EQUIP RENTAL       | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| 776 WOOD FLOORS        | 22,000.00  |         | 0.00 repair and refinish |
| 777 POOL               | 0.00       |         | 0.00                     |
| PERM CLOSE             |            |         | 0.00                     |
| HOA ARCH FEE           |            |         | 0.00                     |
| HOA & TAXES            |            |         | 0.00                     |
| CONST TOTAL            | 654,600.00 |         | 0.00                     |
| <hr/>                  |            |         |                          |
| SALES PRICE            | 872,800.00 |         |                          |
| CONST TOTAL            | 654,600.00 |         |                          |
| UPGRADE                |            |         |                          |
| INCREASED COST         | 0.00       |         |                          |
| BUILDER FEE            | 216,200.00 |         |                          |
| UNDER-OVER+            | 0.00       |         |                          |
| <hr/>                  |            |         |                          |
| LIVING AREA SQFT       | 3,200      |         |                          |
| RETAIL PRICE PER FT    | 272.75     |         |                          |
| MINUS LOT PER FT       | 272.75     |         |                          |

**ATTACHMENT "B"**

Staff's determination of specific necessary work items for rehabilitation of 609 West Lynn Street:

Work order numbers taken from contractor's cost estimate sheet.

NOTE: \* items are those covered by Jaster Quintanilla estimate

|                   |                                |           |
|-------------------|--------------------------------|-----------|
| 707               | SITE WORK                      | \$5,000   |
|                   | Drainage plan and French drain | \$12,000  |
| 709               | FOUNDATION REPAIR              | \$8,700*  |
|                   | Pier and beam repair           | \$80,000* |
|                   | Termite treatment              | \$1,500   |
|                   | Mold treatment                 | \$6,000   |
|                   | Demo and remove addition       | \$10,000  |
| 712               | FRAMING                        | \$29,000* |
|                   | Remove damaged siding          | \$9,000*  |
|                   | Remove damaged lumber          | \$12,000* |
|                   | Rebuild roof deck              | \$6,000*  |
| 713               | Remove and repair windows      | \$18,000  |
| 714               | Exterior doors                 | \$3,000   |
| 715               | Fireplace repair/removal       | \$10,000  |
| 717               | ROOFING                        | \$16,000  |
|                   | Remove old roof                | \$3,000   |
|                   | Vents and flashing             | \$2,500   |
| 718               | Insulation                     | \$6,200   |
| 719               | Sheet rock                     | \$16,000  |
| 720               | PLUMBING                       | \$18,000  |
|                   | Remove old plumbing            | \$6,000   |
| 721               | ELECTRIC                       | \$21,000  |
|                   | Remove old wire                | \$4,000   |
| 722               | Heat and air conditioning      | \$12,000  |
| 723               | Painting                       | \$18,000  |
| 724               | TRIM REPAIR/REPLACEMENT        | \$15,000  |
|                   | Stair rail repair/replacement  | \$9,000   |
| 725               | Trim labor                     | \$13,000  |
| 745               | Silt fence                     | \$3,000   |
| TOTAL             |                                | \$374,900 |
| CONTRACTOR PROFIT | 25%                            | \$93,000  |
| GRAND TOTAL       |                                | \$467,900 |

**ATTACHMENT "C"**

**LIST OF APPRAISED VALUES OF WEST LYNN AND COMPARABLE HOUSES**



**609 West Lynn Street**

**Condition: Poor**

**Use: Vacant**

**20,800 square foot lot**

**2,800 square foot building**

**Zoning: MF-4-NP**

**Land value: \$148,750**

**Improvement value: \$138,528**

**Total: \$287.278**



**611 West Lynn Street**

**Condition: Fair/Poor**

**Use: Vacant**

**28,200 square foot lot**

**3,352 square foot building**

**Zoning: MF-4-NP**

**Land value: \$457,300**

**Improvement value: \$279,439**

**Total: \$736.739**



**613 West Lynn Street**

**Condition: Good**

**Use: Single family residence**

**10,019 square foot lot**

**1,448 square foot building**

**Zoning: MF-4-NP**

**Land value: \$175,000**

**Improvement value: \$169,320**

**Total: \$344.320**



615 West Lynn Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 10,800 square foot lot  
 2,126 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$175,000  
 Improvement value: \$165,274  
 Total: \$340,274



617 West Lynn Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 11,220 square foot lot  
 1,672 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$175,000  
 Improvement value: \$150,092  
 Total: \$325,092



705 West Lynn Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 12,000 square foot lot  
 1,484 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$175,000  
 Improvement value: \$108,908  
 Total: \$283,908





707 West Lynn Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 8,580 square foot lot  
 1,516 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$175,000  
 Improvement value: \$79,662  
 Total: \$254.662



1500 West Ninth Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 22,220 square foot lot  
 3,109 square foot building  
 Zoning: SF-3-H-NP  
 Land value: \$350,000  
 Improvement value: \$212,538  
 Total: \$562.538



702 Highland Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 7,080 square foot lot  
 2,550 square foot building  
 Zoning: SF-3-NP  
 Land value: \$175,000  
 Improvement value: \$223,150  
 Total: \$398.150



1510 West Tenth Street  
 Condition: Good  
 Use: Single family residence  
 9,975 square foot lot  
 2,545 square foot building  
 Zoning: SF-3-NP  
 Land value: \$227,500  
 Improvement value: \$126,999  
 Total: \$354,499



608 Blanco Street  
 Condition: Fair/Good  
 Use: Multi-family residence  
 7,875 square foot lot  
 2,895 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$210,000  
 Improvement value: \$225,046  
 Total: \$435,046



1201-07 W. 8th Street (8th & Blanco)  
 Condition: Fair  
 Use: Multi-family residence  
 14,000 square foot lot  
 1,488 square foot building  
 Zoning: MF-4-NP  
 Land value: \$192,500  
 Improvement value: \$60,000  
 Total: \$252,500



1112 West Ninth Street  
Condition: Good  
Use: Single family residence  
15,000 square foot lot  
2,040 square foot building  
Zoning: MF-4-NP  
Land value: \$306,250  
Improvement value: \$270,583  
Total: \$576.833



705 Oakland Street  
Condition: Good  
Use: Multi-family residence  
6,120 square foot lot  
2,672 square foot building  
Zoning: MF-4-NP  
Land value: \$175,000  
Improvement value: \$192,500  
Total: \$369.946